

Article history: Received 10 January 2024 Revised 13 February 2024 Accepted 19 February 2024 Published online 10 March 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

Comparing the Effectiveness of Emotion-Focused Therapy and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy on Experiential Avoidance in Individuals Grieving Due to COVID-19

Ali Akbar. Salimi Roodsary¹, Shohreh. Ghorban Shiroudi^{2*}, Mohammadali. Rahmani³

- ¹ Ph.D. student of Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran
- ² Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran
- ³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Shghorbanshiroudi@toniau.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Seyed Ali Darbani®	Reviewer 1: Parvaneh Mohammadkhani
Assistant Professor, Department of	Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, University of Rehabilitation Sciences
Psychology and Counseling, South	and Social Health, Tehran, Iran. Email: Pa.mohammadkhani@uswr.ac.ir
Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad	Reviewer 2: Mehdi Rostami
University, Tehran, Iran	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: dr.mrostami@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Clarify the selection criteria for participants, specifically the definition of "complex grief" and how it was identified in potential participants. This specificity will help in replicating the study and in understanding the generalizability of the findings.

Consider discussing the effect size in the results section to provide readers with a sense of the practical significance of the findings, in addition to the statistical significance already reported.

The discussion adeptly connects the findings to the existing literature. Enhancing this section with a more detailed exploration of the practical implications for therapists choosing between EFT and CBT for grieving individuals would be beneficial. Specifically, discuss scenarios or conditions under which one might be preferred over the other.

The limitations section is appropriately acknowledged. Expanding on potential biases in self-report measures and how they might impact the study's findings would offer a more comprehensive view of the limitations.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction section provides a comprehensive background on the psychological impacts of COVID-19, particularly grief. However, it could benefit from a more direct link between these impacts and the necessity for comparing EFT and CBT. Clarifying this connection early in the manuscript will enhance its coherence.

The methods section is well-detailed but could be improved by explicitly stating the hypotheses at the outset of the section. This addition would guide readers through the experimental design with a clear understanding of the study's objectives.

The review covers a wide range of studies supporting the significance of experiential avoidance in grief. To strengthen this section, consider incorporating a more detailed discussion on previous comparative studies of EFT and CBT, specifically in the context of grief due to pandemics or mass trauma events. This could highlight the novelty and relevance of your research.

Given the complex nature of grief, incorporating a qualitative component could enrich the understanding of how participants perceive the effectiveness of each therapy. Future iterations of this study could include interviews or open-ended questionnaires at follow-up to capture this dimension.

The manuscript is generally well-written but contains some sections where the flow could be improved for better readability. Specifically, transitions between sections and paragraphs that delineate shifts in focus (e.g., from the introduction to the literature review) could be smoother.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

