Comparison of the Effectiveness of Dialectical Behavior Therapy Skills Training (DBT-ST) and Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy (MBCT) on Cognitive Emotion Regulation in Individuals with Symptoms of Borderline Personality Disorder

Bahareh. Samadi[1] , Bahram. Mirzaian[2]* , Hossein Ali. Ghanadzadegan[2]

[1] Ph.D Student, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran
[2] Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: bahrammirzaian@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Introduction, Paragraph 4: The sentence "Their behavior is highly unpredictable and their achievements rarely match their capabilities," needs citation to support these assertions about individuals with BPD. Add appropriate references that support these claims.

Literature Review, Paragraph 3: The transition between general descriptions of BPD and the introduction of DBT and MBCT feels abrupt. Include a bridging sentence that clearly states the rationale for using these two therapies in BPD treatment focusing on their mechanisms of action relating to emotion regulation.

Methods, Paragraph 1: The sample size calculation is mentioned, but the formula used is not provided. This omits critical information needed for replicability. Include the actual formula used for the sample size calculation or a more detailed description of the statistical methods used.

Conclusion, Last Sentence: The conclusion states the effectiveness of the therapies but does not address future research directions. Add suggestions for future research, possibly investigating long-term effects of these therapies or comparing them in different demographic groups.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2.   Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The abstract could benefit from a brief statement about the comparative effectiveness of the therapies on specific cognitive emotion regulation strategies. Adding this information will clarify the unique contributions of each therapy. Include a sentence summarizing the main findings related to specific cognitive emotion regulation strategies improved by DBT-ST and MBCT.

Introduction, Paragraph 2: The mention of "emotional instability" and "cognitive emotion dysregulation" is not directly linked to how these therapies address these issues. Expand this section by adding a couple of sentences that directly link these disorders' characteristics to the therapeutic mechanisms of DBT and MBCT.

Methods, Sampling Section: The description of the purposive non-random sampling method lacks justification for its appropriateness in this context. Provide a rationale for choosing purposive non-random sampling over other sampling methods.

Procedure, Paragraph 2: Specific details about the mindfulness exercises used in the MBCT group are vague. Describe specific mindfulness exercises used in the MBCT sessions to give readers a better understanding of the intervention.

Discussion, Paragraph 2: There is a claim that "MBCT is stronger than DBT for this group of individuals," without sufficient comparative data presented in the results section. Ensure that the results section includes detailed comparative data to support this claim, or modify the statement to reflect the data presented.

Discussion, Paragraph 3: The paragraph discussing the biosocial theory and its application to DBT lacks direct citations from primary sources. Cite original studies or primary sources that discuss the biosocial theory in the context of DBT.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2.   Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.