

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Schema Therapy and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy Before Marriage on Emotional Maturity and Body Image of Single Women

Mahrokh. HiraAsa¹, Kourosh. Goodarzi^{2*}, Mehdi. Roozbahani², Sara. Saedi³, Zahra. Tanha⁴

¹ Ph.D. Student, Department of Psychology, Borujerd Branch, Islamic Azad University, Borujerd, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Borujerd Branch, Islamic Azad University, Borujerd, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Quds City Branch, Islamic Azad University, Quds City, Iran


⁴ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorramabad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Khorramabad, Iran


* Corresponding author email address: k.goodarzy@gmail.com

Editor

Abolfazl Karami
Associate Professor, Department of
Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i
University, Tehran, Iran
abolfazlkarami1@gmail.com

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Fahime Bahonar
Department of counseling, Universty of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.
Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University,
Tehran, Iran.
Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The inclusion criteria described in the Methods section could benefit from more detail. Specifically, the rationale for choosing women aged 30 and older should be clarified, explaining why this age group is particularly relevant for the study's focus on pre-marital therapy.

The Methods section should provide a clearer description of what the control group experienced during the study period. Simply stating that they received no intervention might not suffice; detailing their activities or monitoring procedures would strengthen the validity of the findings.

The intervention protocols for schema therapy and cognitive-behavioral therapy are well outlined. However, it would be beneficial to include information on therapist training and fidelity checks to ensure the interventions were delivered consistently.

The reliability coefficients of the Emotional Maturity Questionnaire and the Body Image Questionnaire are discussed, but the text mentions a reliability coefficient of 0.33 for the Emotional Maturity scale, which seems unusually low and possibly incorrect. Clarifying this point is crucial for understanding the tool's reliability.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction lacks a clear statement of the study's specific aims and hypotheses. Adding a precise research question or hypothesis after discussing the background on emotional maturity and body image would enhance clarity (e.g., "This study aims to test the hypothesis that schema therapy and cognitive-behavioral therapy will significantly improve emotional maturity and body image in single women").

In the literature review, some studies mentioned are outdated. For instance, the use of Rao (2017) and Qaderzadeh et al. (2017) should be supplemented with more recent research findings to provide up-to-date context and support for the study's rationale.

The rationale for choosing one-way ANCOVA and one-way ANOVA should be explained in more detail. Including the assumptions tested (e.g., normality, homogeneity of variances) and how these assumptions were verified would add rigor to the data analysis section.

Tables 1 and 4 present descriptive statistics effectively, but they could benefit from additional columns showing confidence intervals for the means. This would provide more context about the variability and reliability of the results.

The Results section mentions the use of Bonferroni and Dunnett's T3 tests. It would be helpful to briefly explain why these particular post-hoc tests were chosen over others, such as Tukey's HSD, to enhance the transparency of the statistical decisions.

The interpretation of findings in the Discussion section should be more critical. For instance, the lack of significant differences between schema therapy and cognitive-behavioral therapy could be explored further to suggest possible reasons or implications for future research.

The discussion on schema therapy's effectiveness is well-founded, but the comparison with other studies could be expanded. For example, contrasting the findings with international research might highlight cultural differences or similarities.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.