

Article history: Received 23 April 2024 Revised 03 June 2024 Accepted 20 June 2024 Published online 10 July 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

The Study of the Process and Nature of Career Identity Formation in Adolescent Girls for Developing an Awareness and Preparedness Model

Shirin. Beiranvand 10, Anahita. Khodabakhshi-Koolaee 20, Mohammad Reza. Falsafinejad 3*0, Mehdi. Zare Bahram Abadi 40

- ¹ PhD Student in Counseling, Department of Counseling, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
- Associate Professor, Department of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Faculty of Humanities, Khatam University, Tehran, Iran
 Associate Professor, Department of Measurement, Faculty of Psychology and Education, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran
 Associate Professor of Humanities Research and Development Institute, Sammet Organization, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Falsafinejad@atu.ac.ir

| Editor | Reviewers |
|---|---|
| Chiedu Eseadi | Reviewer 1: Parvaneh Mohammadkhani |
| Department of Educational Foundations, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria chiedu.eseadi@unn.edu.ng | Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, University of Rehabilitation Sciences and Social Health, Tehran, Iran. Email: Pa.mohammadkhani@uswr.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir |

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The rationale for using a sequential exploratory mixed-method design is clear, but the explanation of how qualitative findings specifically informed the quantitative phase could be more detailed.

The selection criteria for participants are well-defined, but consider explaining how the characteristics of the chosen school (Behesht Aein School) might influence the generalizability of the findings.

The transition from qualitative findings to the development of the model needs more explanation. Describe the steps taken to ensure that the model is grounded in the qualitative data.

While the sampling process is clear, detail how the control group was maintained throughout the study to account for potential external influences.

The table of core and selective codes is informative, but the main categories should be linked back to the specific questions from the semi-structured interviews to illustrate how they emerged.

The descriptive statistics are presented effectively. However, a more detailed discussion of the control group's demographics and how they compare to the experimental group would be beneficial.

The comparison to the research by Batool and Ghayas (2020) is apt. Elaborate on how the use of multiple theories in the current study provided a more comprehensive understanding compared to single-theory approaches.

The implications for career decision-making education are well-articulated. Including specific examples of how the model can be implemented in different educational settings would add practical value.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The concept of identity is broad, but the current definition lacks specificity. Consider including additional theoretical perspectives or definitions to enhance clarity and depth, such as Marcia's identity status theory.

The reference to Erikson (1968) is appropriate, but it would be beneficial to elaborate on how his stages of psychosocial development directly relate to career identity formation in adolescents.

The reliability coefficients of the Career Identity Questionnaire are noted. However, discuss any recent validations or adaptations of the tool to ensure its relevance to the current study population.

The Career Decision-Making Self-Efficacy questionnaire is described well. Including a brief overview of its theoretical underpinnings would strengthen this section.

The process of reaching theoretical saturation is mentioned. It would be helpful to include specific examples of repetitive information that indicated saturation.

The univariate covariance analysis results are significant. Including a brief explanation of the statistical tests used (e.g., why these tests were chosen) would enhance the reader's understanding.

The discussion effectively relates findings to previous research. However, consider expanding on how the current study's findings contribute to existing theories or propose new hypotheses.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

