

Article history: Received 05 April 2024 Revised 27 June 2024 Accepted 08 July 2024 Published online 10 August 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mentalization-Based Therapy and Dialectical Behavior Therapy on Emotion Regulation, Impulsivity, and Self-Esteem in Individuals with Borderline Personality Disorder

Elham. Mostafavi o, Hossein. Rahimlooei Aghdam2*

¹ Ph.D. Student, Department of Psychology, North Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
² M.D, Talieh Mehr Yazdan Medical Center, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Dr.rahimloo@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Maryam Fatehizade [©]	Reviewer 1: Mohammad Salehi D
Professor of Counseling	Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management, Sari Branch, Islamic
Department, Faculty of Educational	Azad University, Sari, Iran. Email: drsalehi@iausari.ac.ir
Sciences and Psychology, Isfahan University, Iran m.fatehizade@edu.ui.ac.ir	Reviewer 2: Sadegh Maleki Avarsin (b)
	Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Tabriz Branch, Islamic
	Azad University, Tabriz, Iran. Email: s.maleki@iaut.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sample size of 45 individuals is mentioned but lacks justification. Please provide a rationale or power analysis to support the adequacy of the sample size for detecting significant differences between groups.

The details regarding the control group's activities are sparse. It is important to state whether the control group received any placebo treatment or were on a waitlist. Clarify this in the methodology.

The follow-up duration of one month is relatively short. Consider discussing the implications of this short follow-up period on the study's findings and any plans for longer follow-up in future research.

The discussion section should elaborate more on the mechanisms by which DBT and MBT might differentially impact emotion regulation, impulsivity, and self-esteem. Cite relevant theories and previous research.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.



1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The article does not describe the randomization process used to allocate participants to the experimental and control groups. Please include a detailed description of the randomization method.

There is no mention of blinding procedures for participants, therapists, or outcome assessors. Discuss whether blinding was implemented and how it was maintained throughout the study.

Details about the training and qualifications of the therapists conducting the MBT and DBT sessions are missing. Provide information on the therapists' backgrounds and any specific training they received for this study.

The validity and reliability of the outcome measures (Jackson and Claridge Borderline Personality Inventory, Emotion Regulation Questionnaire, Dickman Impulsivity Inventory, Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale) should be discussed in more detail, particularly in the context of the Iranian population.

The results section reports p-values but does not include effect sizes. Include effect sizes (e.g., Cohen's d) for the reported outcomes to better understand the magnitude of the differences.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

