

Article history: Received 08 May 2024 Revised 22 July 2024 Accepted 02 August 2024 Published online 10 August 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



The Effectiveness of Adolescent-centered Mindfulness Therapy on Academic Engagement and Buoyancy in Anxious Middle School Students

Elahe. Nikoei Esfahani¹, Mansoureh. Bahramipour Esfahani^{2*}, Mohsen. Golparvar³

¹ PhD student, Department of Educational Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran ³ Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: bahramipourisfahani@yahoo.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Salahadin Lotfi®	Reviewer 1: Karim Afshariniya 💿
PhD in Cognitive Psychology &	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Kermanshah Branch, Islamic Azad
Neuroscience, UWM & Rogers	University, Kermanshah, Iran Email: k.afsharineya@iauksh.ac.ir
Behavioral Health Verified,	Reviewer 2: Abotaleb Saadati Shamir [®]
Lecturer at University of Wisconsin slotfi@uwm.edur	Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, University of Science and
	Research, Tehran, Iran. Email: psychology@iau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"The onset of anxiety can cause psychological and cognitive disturbances in the student population ... "

Comment: Please provide more recent references to support the claim about anxiety's impact on academic performance. Including data from the last five years will strengthen your argument.

"Academic engagement refers to the quantity and quality of students' physical and mental energy ... "

Comment: The definitions provided for academic engagement are thorough, but consider adding a brief explanation of how these definitions will be operationalized in your study.

"A total of 89 students were identified... Finally, 40 students with the highest scores on the Anxiety Inventory were randomly assigned to experimental and control groups."

Comment: Detail the randomization process used to assign students to the experimental and control groups to enhance reproducibility.

JAYPS

"This session introduces mindfulness training and its definition explaining the rationale behind this educational course for participants."

Comment: Consider adding a more detailed explanation of the initial session's activities and how they set the stage for the subsequent sessions.

Comment: Given that the Beck Anxiety Inventory (BAI) was developed over three decades ago, justify its continued relevance and validity for assessing anxiety in contemporary adolescent populations.

"The AEQ developed by Fredericks Blumenfeld and Paris (2004) measures academic engagement with 15 items on a five-point Likert scale..."

Comment: Explain why the AEQ is particularly suited for this study population. Consider discussing any cultural adaptations made for the Iranian context.

"Mean and Standard Deviation of Academic Engagement and Buoyancy in Experimental and Control Groups"

Comment: Include a brief description of the statistical tests used to determine the significance of the differences reported in the table.

"The first finding regarding the effectiveness of adolescent-centered mindfulness therapy on academic engagement aligns with the results of prior studies..."

Comment: Provide more specific comparisons with the prior studies cited. How do the effect sizes and statistical significance levels compare?

"Mindfulness-based therapy positively impacts sensory cognitive and emotional processes..."

Comment: Clarify which specific sensory, cognitive, and emotional processes are impacted by mindfulness-based therapy and how these improvements translate to increased academic engagement.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"The research method was quasi-experimental with a pre-test post-test design including a control group and a two-month follow-up period."

Comment: Please clarify whether there were any attempts to randomize the assignment of students to the experimental and control groups to minimize selection bias.

"Homework is assigned to practice these techniques."

Comment: Describe the nature and duration of the homework assignments. Were they monitored or evaluated in any way? "The Anxiety Inventory developed by Beck Epstein Brown and Steer (1988) measures anxiety symptoms."

"Additionally mindfulness therapy techniques teach anxious students the cognitive and behavioral skills needed to manage stress..."

Comment: Provide examples of specific cognitive and behavioral skills that were taught and how they were measured in the study.

"This study aimed to examine the effectiveness of adolescent-centered mindfulness therapy on the academic engagement and buoyancy of anxious students."

Comment: Summarize any limitations related to the mindfulness intervention itself. Were there any challenges in implementing the therapy sessions that might have affected the outcomes?

"The limited research population to anxious students referred to the District 6 Education Counseling Center in Isfahan was the first limitation."

Comment: Discuss the potential impact of this limitation on the generalizability of the findings. Would results likely differ in a more diverse or geographically varied sample?

"Additionally the psychological and academic conditions of these students' parents were not assessed or controlled."



Comment: Propose methods for assessing and controlling parental influence in future studies. How might parental factors confound the results?

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

