

Article history: Received 27 July 2024 Revised 30 September 2024 Accepted 08 October 2024 Published online 11 November 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

Examining the Process of Youth Influence by Sports Influencers on Online Media

Hamid. Bagheri ¹, Fatemeh. Abdavi ¹, Mohammad Rasool. Khodadadi ¹

¹ Department of Sports Management, University of Tabriz, Tabriz, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: fatemehabdavi@tabrizu.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Salahadin Lotfi [®] PhD in Cognitive Psychology &	Reviewer 1: Karim Afshariniya Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Kermanshah Branch, Islamic Azad
Neuroscience, UWM & Rogers Behavioral Health Verified, Lecturer at University of Wisconsin slotfi@uwm.edur	University, Kermanshah, Iran Email: k.afsharineya@iauksh.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Davood Taghvaei Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran.
Slotti & twin.cdui	Email: d-taghvaeii@iau-arak.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, the cited studies provide good context, but there is no explicit mention of gaps in the current literature that this research aims to address. Clarify how your research builds upon or challenges the existing studies (e.g., Cross et al., 2015; O'Reilly et al., 2012).

In the data analysis section, you mention that two researchers coded the data independently, but no mention is made of interrater reliability measures. I recommend calculating Cohen's Kappa or another statistic to quantify agreement between coders.

In the demographic description of participants, it would be helpful to explain whether the gender imbalance (11 male, 3 female) influenced the findings. Discuss any potential gender-related biases in the responses.

In Table 1, some categories such as "Inspiring Continuous Activity" and "Modeling Behavior and Thinking" appear to overlap in their descriptions. Consider merging or clearly differentiating these categories to avoid redundancy.

The potential long-term impact of influencer behavior on youth is not sufficiently discussed. Consider adding a section on the implications of continued exposure to both positive and negative sports influencer behaviors over time.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The study lacks a clearly defined theoretical framework. Including a model or theory (such as Social Learning Theory or the Influence of Social Media Theory) would strengthen the justification for the research.

The choice of a purposive sample of 14 academic experts is reasonable, but further justification is needed for this sample size. Explain why 14 participants were sufficient to reach saturation, and address the limitations of this sample size for generalizability (see paragraph under "Study Design and Participants").

The sentence "The interview process continued until theoretical saturation was achieved" needs more detail. Clarify how saturation was determined in this study and whether any guidelines were followed to establish it (e.g., inductive thematic saturation).

The quotes used to support findings (e.g., "The stories of perseverance and success shared by influencers...") are effective. However, more direct quotations from participants should be included to illustrate the depth of their responses. Consider adding at least one quote per subcategory.

In the section on improving technology, the link between technology and the influence of sports influencers is mentioned but not elaborated. It would be useful to explore specific technological advancements (e.g., social media algorithms) that enhance or limit influencer impact.

The discussion cites relevant studies (e.g., Dorsch et al., 2020; Evans et al., 2016) but could better integrate these findings with your results. Explicitly state how your results confirm, contrast, or expand upon these earlier studies.

The modeling of ethical behavior and respect in sports is addressed, but the cultural context in which these behaviors are modeled should be explored. Are there cultural differences in how youth from different regions respond to sports influencers?

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

