

Article history: Received 08 May 2024 Revised 01 August 2024 Accepted 06 August 2024 Published online 10 September 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

Effectiveness of Compassion Therapy on Psychological Well-being and Feelings of Shame and Guilt in Underachieving Gifted Adolescents

Marzieh. Hojjati¹, Sara. Nejatifar^{2*}

* Corresponding author email address: saranjt1373@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Thseen Nazir [®] Professor of Psychology and Counseling Department, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey thseen.nazir@ihu.edu.tr	Reviewer 1: Shahrokh Makvand Hoseini Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Semnan University, Iran. Email: shmakvand@semnan.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Davood Taghvaei Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran. Email: d-taghvaeii@iau-arak.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The abstract is clear and concise. However, it would benefit from including more specific information on the statistical methods used, such as the type of mixed analysis of variance employed.

The introduction lacks a clear statement of the research gap. It would strengthen the paper to explicitly state the gap in the existing literature regarding compassion therapy for underachieving gifted adolescents.

The term "underachievement" is well-defined, but the potential reasons for underachievement in gifted students could be further elaborated.

The sample size is mentioned, but the process of random assignment to groups could be detailed further.

The criteria for academic underachievement are provided, but the specific cut-off points for inclusion should be specified.

The description of the Academic Achievement Questionnaire could include more detail about its validity and reliability in this specific study context.

The intervention sessions are well-described, but it would be helpful to include information on the qualifications of the therapists conducting the sessions.

¹ Master's Student in Rehabilitation Counseling, Department of Counseling, Khomeini Shahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Khomeini Shahr, Iran

² PhD Student in Psychology and Education of Children with Special Needs, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The descriptive statistics are presented clearly. However, a graphical representation of these results could enhance understanding.

The table is informative, but including effect sizes for the changes observed would provide more insight into the practical significance of the results.

The assumptions for mixed analysis of variance are checked, but a brief explanation of the significance of these tests would be useful.

The discussion section should compare the study's findings with those of similar studies to contextualize the results.

The mechanisms through which compassion therapy improves psychological well-being could be elaborated upon with references to theoretical frameworks.

The limitations section is adequately detailed but could include a reflection on the potential impact of cultural factors.

Future research directions are suggested, but more specific recommendations for different types of interventions or settings could be beneficial.

The conclusion is concise but could reiterate the practical implications of the findings for educators and psychologists.

Ethical considerations are mentioned, but it would be helpful to state how confidentiality and data protection were maintained.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

