







Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mental Deactivation Therapy and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy Based on Hofmann's Model on State-Trait Anxiety and Fatigability in Adolescents with Generalized Anxiety Disorder

Hajar. Adelifard¹, Moloud. Keykhosravani^{2*}, Seyed Asghar. Mosavi²

¹ PhD student in Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: moloud.keykhosrovani@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
<p>Niloofar Mikaeili Professor of Psychology Department of Mohaghegh Ardabili University, Ardabil, Iran nmikaeili@uma.ac.ir</p>	<p>Reviewer 1: Sara Nejatifar Department of Psychology and Education of People with Special Needs, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran. Email: s.nejatifar@edu.ui.ac.ir</p> <p>Reviewer 2: Kamdin. Parsakia Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: kamdinarsakia@kmanresce.ca</p>

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Some psychologists consider adolescence to be a period of storm and stress characterized by numerous crises and changes in the adolescent's body mind and social life (Sawyer et al. 2018)."

Comment: Ensure that "body mind and social life" is separated by commas for better readability: "body, mind, and social life".

Introduction, Paragraph 2, Lines 8-10: "In social environments anxious adolescents may appear dependent withdrawn or restless. They may seem overly restricted or excessively emotional."

Comment: Consider adding a citation to support the claim regarding the appearance and behavior of anxious adolescents in social environments.

Introduction, Paragraph 3, Lines 2-3: "Spielberger et al. (1983 as cited in Saviola et al. 2020) were the first to divide anxiety into two dimensions: trait anxiety and state anxiety."

Comment: Provide a more detailed explanation of the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (STAI) and its significance in measuring anxiety levels.

Introduction, Paragraph 4, Line 1: "On the other hand research has shown that anxiety is directly related to psychological fatigue (Yuan et al. 2020)."

Comment: Include additional studies or reviews that support the relationship between anxiety and psychological fatigue to strengthen this claim.

Methods and Materials, Data Analysis, Lines 1-2: "In this study data were analyzed using descriptive statistics methods including mean and standard deviation and inferential statistics methods including univariate and multivariate covariance analysis and Bonferroni post hoc test."

Comment: Specify the software used for the data analysis and mention any specific settings or adjustments made during the analysis.

Discussion, Paragraph 1, Lines 1-2: "The primary aim of this study was to examine whether Mental Deactivation Therapy (MDT) and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy based on Hoffman's Model (CBT-HM) are effective in reducing state-trait anxiety and fatigability in adolescents with generalized anxiety disorder."

Comment: Summarize the main findings more explicitly here, including numerical results or effect sizes to reinforce the conclusions.

Discussion, Paragraph 3, Lines 1-2: "Furthermore it was found that CBT-HM is effective in reducing state-trait anxiety and this effectiveness persisted at the 2-month follow-up; therefore the answer to the second research question is affirmative."

Comment: Discuss any potential limitations or biases that might have influenced the findings related to CBT-HM.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Methods and Materials, Study Design, Paragraph 1, Lines 1-3: "This experimental study used a pre-test-post-test design with a control group and follow-up test. The population of this study included all adolescents with generalized anxiety disorder in Bushehr County..."

Comment: Specify the duration between the post-test and the follow-up test for clarity.

Methods and Materials, Study Design, Paragraph 1, Lines 4-5: "From this population 45 individuals were selected using purposive sampling based on inclusion and exclusion criteria."

Comment: Provide details on the inclusion and exclusion criteria used for selecting the participants.

Methods and Materials, Measures, Lines 1-2: "State-Trait Anxiety: This inventory created by Spielberger et al. (1983 as cited in Monshi Toosi et al. 2015) includes two factors state anxiety and trait anxiety with 40 items."

Comment: Clarify whether the Spielberger inventory used in the study has been validated for the adolescent population in the current cultural context.

Methods and Materials, Interventions, MDT Session 1, Lines 2-4: "The initial session involves obtaining informed consent establishing a therapeutic rapport addressing patient ambiguities explaining the MDT theory and its principles and providing homework."

Comment: Break this sentence into two or more sentences for better readability and to avoid confusion.

Methods and Materials, Interventions, CBT-HM Session 1, Lines 1-3: "The first session involves psychoeducation including: a) teaching the basic principles of CBT and presenting the rationale for the therapy b) explaining the basics of anxiety symptoms and discussing the cognitive-behavioral model of anxiety disorder..."

Comment: Consider rephrasing to improve clarity. For example, "The first session includes psychoeducation, which involves: a) teaching the basic principles of CBT and presenting the rationale for the therapy; b) explaining the basics of anxiety symptoms..."

Results, Table 1: "Mean and Standard Deviation of State-Trait Anxiety and Fatigability in Experimental Group 1 Experimental Group 2 and Control Group in Pre-test Post-test and Follow-up Stages."

Comment: Ensure the table includes labels for each column and row to enhance clarity and make the data easier to interpret.

Results, Paragraph 2, Lines 1-2: "The correlation coefficients between the pre-test and post-test (state anxiety trait anxiety and fatigability) were 0.591 0.583 and 0.792 respectively ($p < .05$) thus fulfilling the linearity assumption between covariates and dependent variables."

Comment: Include a brief explanation of why the linearity assumption is important in this context.

Results, Paragraph 3, Lines 1-3: "Levene's statistics for state anxiety trait anxiety and fatigability were 1.348 0.341 and 0.742 respectively which were not statistically significant at the 0.05 level confirming the homogeneity of variances assumption."

Comment: Provide a brief explanation of Levene's test and its role in confirming the homogeneity of variances assumption.

Discussion, Paragraph 4, Lines 1-2: "The results showed a significant difference in the effectiveness of MDT and CBT-HM in reducing state-trait anxiety which persisted at the 2-month follow-up; therefore the answer to the third research question is affirmative."

Comment: Suggest possible reasons for why MDT might be more effective than CBT-HM, supported by relevant literature.

Discussion, Paragraph 5, Lines 1-2: "Another finding of this study showed that MDT was effective in reducing fatigability and this effectiveness persisted at the 2-month follow-up; therefore the answer to the fourth research question is affirmative."

Comment: Provide a more detailed discussion on the mechanisms through which MDT reduces fatigability compared to CBT-HM.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.