




The Comparison of Stress, Anxiety, Depression, and Academic Achievement Among Orphaned and Non-Orphaned High School Girls

Moslem. Pargar¹, Hajar. Torkan^{2*}, Fatemeh Sadat. Mohammadi Bajgirani³


¹ Master of Clinical Psychology, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran



³ PhD Student, Clinical Psychology, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: h.torkan@khuisf.ac.ir

Editor

Stefano Vinaccia¹
Profesor de psicología Universidad
del SINU, Montería, Colombia
Vinalpi47@hotmail.com

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Hooman Namvar¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Saveh Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Saveh, Iran. Email: hnamvar@iau-saveh.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Elham Azarakhsh¹
Department of Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Qom Branch, Qom, Iran.
Email: elhamazarakhsh@qom.iau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence, “Adolescence is a critical period of life, characterized by various risks and challenges” is broad. Consider specifying what types of risks and challenges to set a clearer foundation for your study.

The criteria for matching orphaned and non-orphaned students based on social and economic status need more explanation. Were there any challenges or biases in matching?

In the “Stress” section, the internal consistency ($\alpha = 0.85$) should be discussed concerning the reliability standards in psychological research. Explain why this reliability level is adequate.

The paragraph on the Kutcher Depression Scale should mention any cultural adaptations made for Iranian adolescents, considering possible cultural differences in depression expression.

The explanation of the Shapiro-Wilk test and Levene’s test could benefit from a clearer connection to the study’s assumptions. Explain the significance of normality and variance equality in your analysis.

Clarify why demographic variables such as the mother's age and occupation were chosen as controls. Discuss their potential impact on the dependent variables.

The discussion should address how the findings relate to Iranian cultural norms, especially the roles of family and community support.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The paragraph stating, “Despite extensive research on adolescent depression, anxiety, stress, academic achievement, and the role of fathers...” lacks specificity in describing prior studies. Cite more detailed examples to highlight the novelty of your study.

The research objective, “to compare stress, depression, anxiety, and academic achievement between orphaned high school girls and their non-orphaned peers,” should be further detailed to clarify the hypothesized relationships or expected differences.

The description of the causal-comparative design lacks a rationale. Explain why this design is most suitable for your research questions.

The sentence, “The statistical population included all orphaned high school girls in Mobarekeh city,” should discuss the representativeness of this sample for generalizing results to larger populations.

The description of the Byrne Stress Scale could be improved by specifying how the scale differentiates between various stress sources, such as peer vs. academic stress.

The phrase, “Spence (1997) found internal consistency of $\alpha = 0.92$ and test-retest reliability of $r = 0.6$ after six months,” should elaborate on whether these metrics are appropriate for the study's context.

The eta-squared values mentioned should be interpreted in terms of practical significance. Explain what these values imply for real-world impacts.

The section stating, “Orphaned girls might experience more depression, anxiety, and stress but be conservative in expressing these internal states,” requires additional references to support this interpretation.

Discuss potential confounding factors that could explain the lack of significant differences, such as the influence of community or school support systems.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.