

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Cognitive Hypnotherapy and Successful Intelligence Training on the Mental Toughness of Twelfth-Grade Male Students in District 4 of Tehran

MohammadHassan. Khaleghinejad¹, Pantea. Jahangir^{2*}, Farideh. Dokaneifard³

¹ PhD Student in Counseling, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

³ Associate Professor, Department of Counseling, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: panteajahangir@gmail.com

Editor

Maryam Fatehizade
Professor of Counseling
Department, Faculty of Educational
Sciences and Psychology, Isfahan
University, Iran
m.fatehizade@edu.ui.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Shahrokh Makvand Hoseini
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Semnan University, Iran.
Email: shmakvand@semnan.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Davood Taghvaei
Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran.
Email: d-taghvaeii@iau-arak.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The opening statement is somewhat vague. It would be beneficial to specify how students are positioned within future societal transformations, perhaps by referencing recent trends or developments in education or society. This would create a clearer foundation for the significance of the study.

While the four components of mental toughness are well-explained, a brief discussion on how these components might manifest in the academic life of a student would add relevance to the reader. How does each component specifically affect students' performance or behavior in the classroom?

This statement is overly general and lacks citation. Providing specific studies or expert opinions to support this claim would enhance credibility and scientific rigor.

Consider further elaborating on how these abilities interact with each other in the development of successful intelligence. For example, how does creativity enhance analytical skills or vice versa? This would enrich the conceptual framework.

The phrase "creating an open environment" is somewhat abstract. Could you provide more detail on what this "open environment" entails in practical terms? Does it involve group discussions, new types of assignments, or exposure to diverse perspectives?

This section could benefit from more precise examples of the "challenges adolescents face." Are these challenges related to academic performance, emotional regulation, or social pressures? Clarifying this would make the introduction more specific and relatable to the research objectives.

The research question is clearly stated; however, it would be helpful to define what "mental toughness" specifically entails in the context of this study. Is it measured through perseverance, stress management, or emotional regulation? This could improve clarity on what the study is aiming to measure.

The choice of convenience sampling is noted, but this raises questions about the generalizability of the results. It might be helpful to briefly acknowledge this limitation in the discussion of the methodology and suggest how it could affect the findings.

While the inclusion criteria are clear, it would be valuable to specify whether there were any exclusion criteria (e.g., students with pre-existing mental health conditions). This would provide more transparency about the sample selection process.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

While mental toughness is indeed an important factor, it might be useful to define what specific aspects of performance and well-being are most influenced by mental toughness in the context of adolescents. This would narrow the scope and highlight the importance of the study.

Consider elaborating on how mental toughness specifically impacts adolescents in a learning environment. Examples from recent research or a brief discussion of how it relates to academic or social challenges in this demographic would strengthen the argument.

It would be beneficial to specify which psychological states or behaviors are most unstable during adolescence. This could include emotional regulation, identity formation, or decision-making processes, which are highly relevant to the study's focus.

The mention of "anxiety-related emotions" could be further unpacked. Are these general feelings of anxiety, or do they relate to specific pressures (e.g., academic, social, familial)? Providing examples would make this section more precise and impactful.

This claim about psychological disorders being "negative forms of self-hypnosis" may benefit from a more detailed explanation. How does self-hypnosis manifest in real-world cases, and how does this relate to the intervention being studied?

This is a basic definition of CBT, but more specific detail would help. A brief explanation of how CBT techniques are integrated into cognitive hypnotherapy would clarify the method for readers who may not be familiar with the intervention.

This sentence introduces successful intelligence but could be improved by a clearer link to the previous discussion about mental toughness. A brief explanation of how successful intelligence relates to mental toughness or psychological resilience would create a more cohesive narrative.

While the Clough Mental Toughness Questionnaire is widely used, it would be beneficial to discuss why it was chosen specifically for this population (e.g., its relevance to adolescents, its prior use in similar studies). Additionally, consider mentioning any adaptations made to the instrument for this study.

The protocol developed by Alaeddin is cited, but it would be helpful to include a brief summary of its core components to give readers a clearer understanding of the intervention. For instance, what specific cognitive-behavioral techniques were integrated with hypnotherapy in this protocol?

Similar to the previous comment, it would be valuable to outline the core components of the successful intelligence training protocol. What specific exercises or activities are included in the training to develop analytical, creative, and practical intelligence?

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.