

The Relationship Between Intelligence Profile and Personality Profile with Academic Underachievement and Academic Emotions in Male High School Students in Tehran

Hossein. Masoumi¹, Firoz. Kiyoumars^{2*}

¹ MA Student, Department of Clinical Psychology, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Islamshahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Islamshahr, Iran.

* Corresponding author email address: firozkiyoumars@gmail.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Stefano Vinaccia  Profesor de psicología Universidad del SINU, Montería, Colombia Vinalpi47@hotmail.com	Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorasgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: yousefi1393@khuif.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mehdi Rostami  Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: dr.mrostami@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The paragraph beginning with "Some researchers define giftedness in terms of high intelligence quotient (IQ)..." lacks a clear connection to the study's primary variables. It would be beneficial to streamline this discussion to focus more on academic underachievement and emotions rather than general giftedness.

The paragraph stating, "To determine the sample size, maximum precision was required..." does not provide a rationale for why 180 students were selected. Including a power analysis or justification based on prior studies would enhance the methodological rigor.

The correlation matrix in Table 2 reports significant relationships, but the text only briefly states these findings. The discussion should elaborate on whether these correlations align with previous studies and what they imply about intelligence's impact on academic emotions.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph discussing the Big Five personality traits, the study states, "Among the Big Five personality traits, conscientiousness and emotional stability are particularly critical..." but does not cite specific empirical studies supporting this claim. Adding references would strengthen the theoretical foundation.

The sentence, "Academic underachievement is defined as the failure to acquire the expected skills resulting from educational experiences," should clarify whether this definition is based on existing literature or developed by the authors. A supporting citation is necessary.

The statement, "The reliability coefficients of the Stanford-Binet Intelligence Scale were above 0.90, reflecting excellent internal consistency," should include information on how this was determined (e.g., Cronbach's alpha, test-retest reliability) and provide citations if these values come from previous research.

The results section presents Table 1 without adequately discussing the implications of the means and standard deviations. A brief interpretation explaining how these values reflect variations in academic emotions and underachievement would be helpful.

In Table 4, the sentence, "Multiple regression results indicate a significant negative relationship between verbal and non-verbal intelligence and both academic underachievement and negative academic emotions," should specify the strength of these relationships (e.g., beta coefficients) and discuss practical implications.

The paragraph stating, "The study found that externalizing behaviors such as substance abuse, aggression, and emotional reactivity significantly contributed to academic underachievement and negative academic emotions," lacks references to prior studies that found similar results. Adding comparative discussion would enhance the argument.

The study emphasizes negative academic emotions but does not explore positive emotions in depth. A sentence like, "Positive academic emotions were correlated with higher intelligence scores, suggesting a buffering effect against underachievement," should be expanded with theoretical insights.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.