





The Effect of Traditional and Game-Based Teaching Models on Learning Volleyball Skills in Adolescent Boys


Elnaz. Ebrahimi Khayat¹, Maedeh. Ahmadpoor², Sasan. Bahremand¹, Meysam. Rezaee^{1*}

¹ Department of Physical Education and Sports Sciences, Mashhad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Mashhad, Iran



² PhD Student, Department of Sports Behavioral and Cognitive Sciences, Faculty of Sports and Health Sciences, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: rezaee4703@mshdiau.ac.ir

Editor

John S. Carlson
Distinguished Professor of the
Department of Educational
Psychology, Michigan State
University, East Lansing, MI,
United
carlsoj@msu.edu

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Sara Nejatifar
Department of Psychology and Education of People with Special Needs, Faculty of
Educational Sciences and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.
Email: s.nejatifar@edu.ui.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University,
Tehran, Iran.
Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The title accurately reflects the study's scope, but consider specifying "quasi-experimental" to clarify the study design. In the abstract, the sentence "Combining these approaches is recommended to optimize skill acquisition..." is a key conclusion; consider elaborating briefly on how these approaches could be integrated.

The description of the "Setting Skill Test" mentions evaluation based on volleys per minute. Provide justification for why this metric is a valid measure of skill and if other metrics were considered.

The explanation "The students practiced under the instructor's supervision, and corrections were provided..." could benefit from more detail. Specify whether corrections were immediate or reserved for the session's end, as this impacts learning outcomes.

While "small-sided games such as two-on-two and three-on-three matches" are mentioned, include details on how game scenarios were tailored to ensure skill development across varying competency levels.

The use of ANCOVA is appropriate for this study. However, elaborate on how homogeneity of regression slopes was tested and whether it was met, as this assumption is critical for ANCOVA.

The table shows a marked improvement in volleyball skills post-intervention. Highlight the practical significance of these improvements for coaches and educators beyond statistical significance.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph starting with "Sports, particularly in the context of education and physical training...", the authors cite multiple benefits of volleyball. Consider expanding on why adolescent boys were chosen as the focus group and how this demographic benefits uniquely from these training methods.

The sentence "Research has shown that this approach can be effective in fostering accuracy and mastery..." lacks a direct citation. Please provide specific studies that demonstrate this effect for clarity.

In the section describing the sampling process, the authors state, "A convenience sampling method was used...". While practical, this method may limit generalizability. Address how this limitation is mitigated or could be improved in future research.

The sentence "The Traditional Teaching Model exhibited slightly higher effect sizes..." could benefit from clarification. Discuss what constitutes a "slightly higher" effect and its implications in practical settings.

In the discussion section, the authors state, "This combination of technical learning and experiential practice...". It would be beneficial to link this finding explicitly to existing learning theories or frameworks.

The sentence "coaches should consider the players' needs and training contexts..." could be expanded with specific recommendations for integrating these methods, supported by study findings.

The conclusion effectively summarizes key findings. However, the sentence "Combining these two approaches..." could include a roadmap or brief action plan for implementation in school or club settings.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.