

Article history: Received 06 December 2024 Revised 23 February 2025 Accepted 01 March 2025 Published online 10 March 2025

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

The Effectiveness of Religious Spirituality Training in Improving Interpersonal Relationships and Personality Development

Mahdi. Taghavi Rafsanjani1*10

* Corresponding author email address: taghavi@vru.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Sergii Boltivets®	Reviewer 1: Fahime Bahonar
Chief Researcher of the Department	Department of counseling, Universty of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.
of Scientific Support of Social	Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir
Formation of Youth. Mykhailo Drahomanov University, Ukraine sboltivets@ukr.net	Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani [©]
	Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University,
	Tehran, Iran.
	Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "decision-making is often influenced by personal and transcendental beliefs rather than logic" (Komijani, 2023) needs clarification. Specify the types of crises in which transcendental beliefs dominate and provide empirical support for this generalization.

The sentence "From this population, a sample of 24 students who scored low on the Relationship Quality Questionnaire was selected" lacks detail. What was the cutoff score or criterion used to define "low"? Please specify.

The description of the Relationship Quality Questionnaire mentions reliability from different years (1997 and 2020). Please clarify which version was used, and whether the psychometric properties were revalidated for the current study sample.

While reliability values from Barrett and Gray (1989) are mentioned, consider discussing the cultural adaptation and validation of the GWPQ for Iranian adolescents, since the original instrument was developed in a different cultural context.

The inclusion of Dua Kumayl and Islamic prayers is appropriate for the cultural context, but how was spiritual engagement measured or tracked across participants? Adding a process evaluation metric could strengthen this section.

The theological components, such as qada wa qadar and divine mercy, are heavily emphasized. Please clarify whether any psychological models (e.g., cognitive restructuring, mindfulness) were used to translate these into therapeutic mechanisms.

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Islamic Studies, Vali Asr (Aj) Rafsanjan University, Kerman, Iran

The paragraph describing assumption testing states "The results confirmed that the assumption of normality... was met (p > 0.05)" without providing specific test names (e.g., Shapiro-Wilk or Kolmogorov-Smirnov). Please identify the tests used.

The phrase "the mean and standard deviation… were higher than those in the control group" is descriptive but not analytical. Please include effect size metrics (e.g., Cohen's d) to demonstrate the practical significance of the changes.

You report a very high F-value (e.g., F = 81.03) and $\eta^2 = 0.80$. This suggests an unusually strong effect for a behavioral intervention. Please consider discussing possible overestimation due to small sample size (n = 24) in the Discussion section.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The passage "individual differences in temperament and behavior appear early in life..." would benefit from more integration with the study's target population (adolescents aged 17–18). How do these early differences relate to developmental processes during late adolescence?

In the sentence "personality operates at the individual level and can be defined as...", please cite a recent source to support this definition of personality, such as a 2020s reference, to strengthen its relevance.

The paragraph describing dyadic-level relationships vs. individual-level personality needs further elaboration on how these constructs interact developmentally over time—especially given the intervention's focus on both.

The phrase "it is essential to recognize that in the Iranian and Islamic society..." requires substantiation. Please cite national studies or sociocultural sources that support the influence of religious beliefs on Iranian adolescent behavior.

The statement "These findings align with the prior studies..." is vague. Please specify which findings (e.g., increased relationship depth or personality subscales) aligned with which cited studies and in what way.

The argument that "religious education rooted in fitrah and rationality..." prevents "superficial beliefs" is philosophical and speculative. Consider citing developmental psychology literature that empirically supports this assertion.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

