


Counselors' Strategies for Supporting Emotional Well-Being in Gifted Adolescents

Seyed Ali. Darbani*¹ 



¹ Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: dr.alidarbani@iuast.ac.ir

Editor

Seyyed Mohsen Asgharinekah 
Associate Professor, Department of
Counseling and Educational
Psychology, Faculty of Education
and Psychology, Ferdowsi
University of Mashhad, Mashhad,
Iran
asghari-n@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Thseen Nazir 
Professor of Psychology and Counseling Department, Ibn Haldun University,
Istanbul, Turkey.
Email: thseen.nazir@ihu.edu.tr
Reviewer 2: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh 
Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran,
Iran.
Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "Gifted adolescents frequently experience heightened levels of stress, anxiety, and mental health issues due to the pressures associated with their exceptional abilities" would benefit from more recent references to support the claim, as the most recent citation here is from 2020. Including studies from 2021-2023 would enhance the current relevance.

The process of achieving theoretical saturation is mentioned but not detailed. Include how saturation was determined and any specific indicators that no new themes were emerging.

The table categorizes the results but lacks numerical data. Including the frequency or percentage of counselors mentioning each concept would provide a clearer picture of which strategies are most commonly used.

The effectiveness of "group activities, social clubs, collaborative projects" should include references to studies that have shown these methods to be beneficial for social integration among gifted adolescents.

The synthesis of findings with existing literature could be more robust. Explicitly compare how the study's findings align or diverge from key studies mentioned in the introduction.

The impact of maintaining confidentiality on building trust is discussed. Consider including a reference to empirical evidence or theory, such as attachment theory, that supports this practice.

The statement "By teaching coping strategies such as mindfulness and deep breathing, counselors can help gifted adolescents manage stress and anxiety effectively" would benefit from discussing any potential limitations or challenges in implementing these strategies.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The reference to "Devi (2023) underscores the importance of emotional regulation in maintaining mental health" lacks specificity about the nature of the study. Please clarify if this is a meta-analysis, longitudinal study, or another research type to give context to the readers.

The claim that "mathematically gifted adolescents may have deficiencies in social valuation and mentalization" (Yun et al., 2011) should include a brief explanation of what "social valuation" and "mentalization" entail to ensure clarity for all readers.

The sample size of 21 counselors is relatively small. Discuss how this might impact the generalizability of the findings and if there were any efforts to mitigate this limitation, such as ensuring diverse geographic representation.

The interview guide section should include an example of the open-ended questions used to provide transparency and reproducibility.

The quote "Taking the time to listen and truly understand their concerns helps in creating a safe space for them" would be strengthened by linking it directly to specific literature or theories that support this approach in counseling.

The statement "Every student is different so our approach has to reflect that individuality" could be expanded to discuss specific methods or tools used to tailor these approaches.

The effectiveness of "mindfulness and breathing exercises" should be backed by citing specific studies or meta-analyses that demonstrate their success in similar populations.

The mention of "cognitive restructuring" would benefit from an example or case study to illustrate how this technique is applied in practice with gifted adolescents.

Art therapy and music therapy are mentioned. Clarify if these were based on the counselors' anecdotal experiences or if there is empirical evidence supporting their effectiveness with gifted adolescents.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.