

Article history: Received 03 July 2023 Revised 03 August 2023 Accepted 09 August 2023 Published online 01 October 2023

Psychological Research in Individuals with Exceptional Needs

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3060-6713

Social Support Networks and Mental Health in Gifted Students

Mehdi. Rostami¹

* Corresponding author email address: mehdirostami@kmanresce.ca

Editor

Seyyed Mohsen Asgharinekah[®]
Associate Professor, Department of
Counseling and Educational
Psychology, Faculty of Education
and Psychology, Ferdowsi
University of Mashhad, Mashhad,
Iran
asghari-n@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Mohammadreza Zarbakhsh Bahri 🗓

Associate Professor 'Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: M.Zarbakhsh@Toniau.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Seyed Ali Darbani

Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

Email: Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The first paragraph introduces the challenges faced by gifted students but could benefit from a clearer definition of "gifted students" and how their intellectual abilities specifically impact their mental health. This context would help readers unfamiliar with the topic.

Clarify the process of developing the interview guide. Including an example of a few key questions or themes covered during the interviews would provide readers with a better understanding of the data collection process.

The initial coding process is briefly mentioned. Providing a more detailed explanation of how the coding was performed, perhaps with examples, would help readers appreciate the rigor of the analysis.

The table presents categories, subcategories, and concepts but lacks explicit examples or quotes from participants. Including illustrative quotes would enhance the richness of the qualitative data.

"One student shared 'My parents always encourage me to pursue my interests and are there for me when I need emotional support." - Adding more context around this quote, such as the frequency and nature of this support, would provide deeper insights into the role of family support.

Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada | Rehabilitation Department, York Rehab Clinic, Toronto, Canada



The section would benefit from a discussion on any negative aspects of peer support or peer relationships, such as potential conflicts or misunderstandings among gifted students.

There is a mention of teacher empathy and academic understanding. Providing specific examples of how teachers demonstrated these qualities would make the findings more tangible.

The discussion on professional counseling lacks detail on the types of counseling services available and any specific outcomes reported by participants. Including this information would add depth to the findings.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"Elmer, Mepham, and Stadtfeld (2020) highlight that social networks play a significant role in students' mental health, particularly during crises such as the COVID-19 pandemic." - This sentence should be expanded to include a brief summary of the specific findings from Elmer et al. to provide more context.

The mention of "heightened sensitivity and intense emotions" in gifted students needs citation. Adding references to support this statement would strengthen the argument.

The discussion on bullying and victimization among gifted students should be elaborated with more recent statistics or studies to underscore its current relevance and impact.

The section would benefit from a more detailed description of the phenomenological approach used. Specifically, explaining why this method was chosen and how it is suited to exploring the lived experiences of gifted students would add depth to the methodology.

The link between family support and the findings of Alexopoulou, Batsou, and Drigas (2019) should be elaborated to show how the current study's findings corroborate or differ from previous research.

The discussion on mentorship is brief. Expanding on the types of mentorship and the specific benefits observed in participants would provide a more comprehensive view of this support mechanism.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

E-ISSN: 3060-6713