

Article history: Received 20 June 2024 Revised 05 August 2024 Accepted 14 August 2024 Published online 01 October 2024

Psychological Research in Individuals with Exceptional Needs

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3060-6713

Ego State Therapy: A Randomized Controlled Trial on Prosocial and Health Motivational Outcomes in Young Adults with Physical Disabilities

Shazia. Malik^{1*}

* Corresponding author email address: Shmalikpsych@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Seyyed Mohsen Asgharinekah®	Reviewer 1: Thseen Nazir®
Associate Professor, Department of	Professor of Psychology and Counseling Department, Ibn Haldun University,
Counseling and Educational	Istanbul, Turkey.
Psychology, Faculty of Education	Email: thseen.nazir@ihu.edu.tr
and Psychology, Ferdowsi	Reviewer 2: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh®
University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran	Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran,
asghari-n@um.ac.ir	Iran.

Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The reference to "Frederick 2013; Yanagihara et al. 2016" needs more context on the relevance of their work to Ego State Therapy and its application to individuals with physical disabilities.

The sentence "Research has shown that prosocial behavior is linked to positive social outcomes..." should be supported with specific examples or studies to strengthen the argument.

The sentence "Studies have shown that interventions targeting health motivation can lead to significant improvements..." would benefit from specific examples of such interventions and their outcomes.

The techniques used for identifying ego states, such as guided imagery and mindfulness, should be described in more detail to allow replication.

Provide an example of what a visual representation (map) of ego states might look like and its purpose in therapy.

The description of the ANOVA with repeated measurements should specify the within-subjects and between-subjects factors.

Include a note explaining any abbreviations used in the table for clarity (e.g., M for mean, SD for standard deviation).

¹ Department of Cognitive Sciences, Aligarh Muslim University, Aligarh, India



The sentence "Prior to conducting the ANOVA with repeated measurements..." should mention if any data transformations were performed to meet the assumptions.

The table should include effect sizes for the reported ANOVA results to provide a sense of the magnitude of the effects.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Expand on the concept of "ego states" and how they differ from general personality traits to provide clarity for readers unfamiliar with the terminology.

Provide more details on the recruitment process and criteria for inclusion to ensure reproducibility.

Clarify whether the Prosocialness Scale for Adults (PSA) was administered in the participants' native language or if it was translated.

The statement "The results indicated a significant improvement in both prosocial behavior and health motivation..." should specify the extent of the improvements for both variables.

Provide more details on how the improvements in prosocial behavior align with existing literature, possibly with a comparison of effect sizes.

The mention of psychological integration should be elaborated with specific mechanisms by which EST might achieve this integration.

The limitation regarding self-report measures should suggest alternative or complementary objective measures for future research.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

E-ISSN: 3060-6713