

Article history: Received 08 September 2023 Revised 13 December 2023 Accepted 19 December 2023 Published online 01 January 2024

# **KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus**

**OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT** 



# Investigating the Effect of Storytelling on Academic Engagement and Academic Buoyancy of Elementary School Students in Babol

Khadijeh. Zolfaghar Kharrat<sup>1</sup><sup>(b)</sup> Seyedeh Zahra. Sadati<sup>2\*</sup><sup>(b)</sup>

<sup>1</sup> M.A., Department of Educational Sciences, Babol Branch, Islamic Azad University, Babol, Iran <sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Qaemshahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qaemshahr, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: sadati.zahra@yahoo.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Anela Hasanagic 🖻	Reviewer 1: Kamdin Parsakia
Full Professor, Department of	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
Psychology, Faculty of Islamic	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: kamdinparsakia@kmanresce.ca
Education, University of Zenica,	Reviewer 2: Ali Khodaei
Bosnia and Herzegovina anela.hasanagic@unze.ba	Department of Psychology, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Payam
	Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alikhodaei@pnu.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

## 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The "Intervention" paragraph lists the twelve sessions without sufficient detail on how these sessions align with the study's objectives. Consider expanding each session description to clarify how they contribute to the development of academic engagement and buoyancy.

The "Introduction" lacks a comprehensive discussion of gaps in the existing literature on storytelling's impact on academic engagement. Reference studies that show inconsistent findings, if any, to strengthen the rationale for this study.

While the Academic Engagement Questionnaire is cited as reliable, more detail is needed regarding its validity across different cultural contexts, as it was used in a unique setting here.

The text briefly mentions using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test. Add details on the test's results for each variable to show that data met assumptions for parametric testing.

In the "Findings and Results," while differences are significant, the effect sizes for academic engagement and buoyancy should be presented to understand the practical impact of storytelling.

Clearly state the study's hypotheses in the introduction or methods section. This provides readers with clear expectations before the results are discussed.

The study takes place in Babol. Include a brief discussion on whether storytelling's impact on academic engagement and buoyancy might differ in other cultural contexts.

The "Discussion and Conclusion" mentions generalization cautiously but could expand on specific limitations, such as sample size, sampling method, and study duration, that might impact external validity.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Clearly define "academic engagement" and "academic buoyancy" as used in this context. While there is a general description, specific definitions for the study would help clarify these constructs.

The use of ANCOVA and MANCOVA should be better justified. Explain why these techniques were chosen over other methods and how they enhance the analysis.

There is little information about what the control group engaged in during the intervention period. Describe if they participated in alternative activities or received no intervention at all, as this affects the study's internal validity.

The protocol by Mousavi and Baghuli (2019) was used but lacks a description of how this protocol specifically supports academic engagement and buoyancy, making it difficult to assess relevance.

The statement "storytelling significantly enhances academic engagement and buoyancy" should be more precise by specifying which areas of academic engagement (behavioral, cognitive, emotional) were affected.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

#### 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

