




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Reality Therapy and Compassion-Focused Therapy on Emotion Regulation in Gifted High School Girls


Fatemeh. Hemmati¹, Shaban. Haydari^{2*}, Mohammadkazem. Fakhri²

¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran



² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Shabanheidari1@gmail.com

Editor

Anela Hasanagic
Full Professor, Department of Psychology, Faculty of Islamic Education, University of Zenica, Bosnia and Herzegovina
anela.hasanagic@unze.ba

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Faranak Saboonchi
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: faranaksaboonchi@pnu.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Maasuomeh Behboodi
Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: masomehbehbodi@riau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Success and progress in learning are the goals of all educational systems..."

This section lacks citations to substantiate the claims about educational systems and academic anxiety. Adding references, especially recent studies, would strengthen this argument.

"Emotion regulation through thoughts and cognition is associated with individuals' lives..."

Consider elaborating on how emotion regulation specifically impacts academic performance, as it directly relates to the study's focus on gifted students.

"Informed consent was obtained, and the participants were matched and randomly assigned..."

Provide additional details about the randomization process. For example, was a software program used? How was group equivalence verified?

"Compassion-focused therapy... The structure and principles of the sessions are explained."

The description of the CFT sessions is comprehensive but could benefit from integrating examples of specific exercises used during the sessions.

"A one-way repeated measures analysis of variance (ANOVA)..."

It would be helpful to explain why this specific statistical test was chosen over others, considering the study design.

"All data analyses were conducted using SPSS software, version 23."

Mention any additional statistical tests conducted to ensure robustness, such as post-hoc tests for group comparisons.

Table 1: "Mean and Standard Deviation of the Emotion Regulation Variable..."

Improve the clarity of the table by including notes on what constitutes a significant difference between groups.

"The results in Table 3 indicate differences in the emotion regulation variable..."

Add a clearer interpretation of the Eta squared values for readers unfamiliar with this statistic.

"A key emphasis in reality therapy is on making moral judgments..."

This interpretation of reality therapy is strong but could benefit from citing additional primary sources to corroborate the claims.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"The research sample, based on purposive and convenience sampling, included 45 individuals..."

The sampling strategy could benefit from more justification. Why was convenience sampling chosen over random sampling? Discuss the potential limitations this might introduce.

"The inclusion criteria were being a high school student at a gifted school..."

Clarify whether the inclusion criteria were assessed through specific measures or self-reporting. This detail will improve replicability.

"Reality therapy sessions were conducted in eight 60-minute sessions..."

Consider including a brief explanation of why session durations differ between the two therapeutic approaches (60 vs. 90 minutes) and how this might affect outcomes.

"The Emotion Regulation Questionnaire, developed by Garnefski and Kraaij (2006), is an 18-item self-report tool..."

Mention if the instrument has been validated for use with the target demographic of gifted high school girls, as this would strengthen its relevance.

"The findings indicated that both reality therapy and compassion-focused therapy had a significant effect..."

Consider including effect sizes in the main text, as this would provide a clearer picture of the practical significance of the findings.

"The results indicated that both therapeutic approaches...with reality therapy being more effective."

Discuss potential reasons why reality therapy was more effective than compassion-focused therapy in more depth. Could session duration or group dynamics have played a role?

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.