

Article history: Received 07 June 2024 Revised 20 September 2024 Accepted 29 September 2024 Published online 01 November 2024

# **KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus**

**OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT** 



# Effectiveness of Cognitive-Behavioral Play Therapy on Social Anxiety and Academic Self-Efficacy in Elementary School Students with Learning Disabilities

Mahla. Shabani<sup>1</sup>, Mitra. Sadoughi<sup>2\*</sup>, Eshagh. Samkhaniani<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Master's Student in Educational Psychology, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran <sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran <sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

#### \* Corresponding author email address: sadoughi\_mitra@yahoo.com

| Editor   | R e v i e w e r s  |
|--|--|
| Anela Hasanagic <sup>®</sup>   | Reviewer 1: Parvaneh Mohammadkhani   |
| Full Professor, Department of<br>Psychology, Faculty of Islamic<br>Education, University of Zenica,<br>Bosnia and Herzegovina<br>anela.hasanagic@unze.ba | Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, University of Rehabilitation Sciences<br>and Social Health, Tehran, Iran. Email: Pa.mohammadkhani@uswr.ac.ir |
|  | Reviewer 2: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh <sup>®</sup>  |
|  | Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran,  |
|  | Iran.  |
|  | Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir  |

### 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction outlines the significance of learning disabilities but could benefit from more recent global prevalence data to provide a broader perspective beyond Iran-specific statistics.

The transition from learning disabilities to anxiety and self-efficacy could be smoother. Consider explicitly linking these variables to emphasize their interdependence.

The validity and reliability of the Conover Social Anxiety Questionnaire and Jinks and Morgan Academic Self-Efficacy Scale are well-established but would benefit from a brief explanation of their suitability for the study population.

Tables are clear, but adding effect sizes (Cohen's d or  $\eta^2$ ) alongside means and standard deviations in Table 1 would better convey the practical significance of findings.

The results of assumption tests (e.g., normality, homogeneity) are presented, but their implications for interpreting the data could be more explicitly stated.

Including a figure or graph to depict pre-test and post-test changes for both groups would enhance the visual impact of the results.

The high effect sizes in Table 2 warrant further discussion regarding their practical implications for interventions in similar populations.

The discussion effectively links results to prior research but over-relies on listing studies. Synthesize these findings to highlight unique contributions of the study.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Terms such as "academic self-efficacy" and "social anxiety" are defined but would benefit from more nuanced, contextspecific explanations to ensure clarity for non-specialist readers.

The choice of purposive sampling is justified, but its potential limitations for generalizability should be discussed, especially given the small sample size (n = 30).

More details about how Shahryar Doost's CBPT protocol was implemented (e.g., therapist qualifications, adherence checks) would improve transparency and replicability.

The explanation of how CBPT reduces social anxiety and improves self-efficacy could delve deeper into psychological mechanisms, such as cognitive restructuring or reinforcement.

Reference to self-determination theory and psychoanalytic perspectives in the discussion enriches the narrative. However, these could be more explicitly linked to the study's findings.

The limitation regarding the study's focus on female students in a single city is mentioned but could be expanded to include other potential biases (e.g., therapist influence, short follow-up period).

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

