




Meta-Analysis of the Effectiveness of Various Play Therapies on Aggression in Children with Attention Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder


Azam. Baktashian¹, Mansure. Shahriari^{2*}, Masoud. Ghasemi²

¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology and Exceptional Children, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: mansure_shahriari@yahoo.com

Editor

John S. Carlson
Distinguished Professor of the
Department of Educational
Psychology, Michigan State
University, East Lansing, MI,
United
carlosoj@msu.edu

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Taher Tizdast
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: taheer.tizdast@toniau.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Meysam Sadeghi
Assistant Professor of Department of Cognitive Psychology, Higher Education
Institute of Cognitive Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: m.sadeghi@icss.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the paragraph starting with "Children with ADHD have inappropriate levels of inattention...", the sentence structure is dense and repetitive. Simplify or break it into smaller sentences to enhance clarity and focus on selective versus sustained attention challenges.

The "Methods and Materials" section mentions the inclusion criteria for studies (e.g., use of valid tools). However, the details regarding how validity and reliability were assessed are missing. Provide specific criteria or examples of these tools.

In the methods, the scope of the meta-analysis is defined by articles published between 2012–2022. Explain why this time frame was chosen and whether it might omit relevant older studies.

In the methods section, 60 studies were initially collected, but only 27 were analyzed. Expand on reasons for attrition and the specific metrics that led to study exclusion.

In the discussion, it is mentioned that children "learn to regulate aggression through appropriate feedback." Specify what constitutes "appropriate feedback" in therapeutic settings.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the introduction, different terms like "executive function deficits," "cognitive functions," and "mental activities" are used interchangeably. Ensure consistency in terminology or provide definitions to avoid confusion.

In the sentence mentioning "Barkley's theory" (Asghari Nekah & Abedi, 2014), the explanation of the theory's relevance to inhibition control could be expanded to connect it more directly to the discussion of ADHD.

In the statement "Considering that various studies on ADHD have been conducted in different regions and age groups...", the distinction between global and regional studies is introduced but not elaborated upon. Clarify why regional insights are crucial.

The rationale for choosing CMA and MAXQDA software for analysis is not explained. Briefly justify their use and how each contributes to the meta-analysis.

In the discussion, "Cohen's index above 0.5" is mentioned. Clarify whether this pertains to a specific type of play therapy or the aggregate effect size across interventions.

In the discussion, theoretical explanations (e.g., frustration-aggression theory) are well-articulated, but practical implications are limited. Include more on how play therapy strategies can be implemented in educational or clinical settings.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.