

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Positive Thinking Therapy and Dialectical Behavior Therapy on Behavioral Modification and Management, Self-Awareness, and Meaning-Making in the Lives of Vulnerable Adolescents Covered by Welfare Services in Tehran



Mahin. Molaei Jolandan¹, Javad. Khalatbari^{2*}, Shohreh. Ghorban Shiroudi³

¹ PhD Student of General Psychology, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

³ Associate Professor, Department of Counseling, Faculty of Humanities, North Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: javadkhalatbaripsy2@gmail.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Izet Pehlić  Full professor for Educational sciences, Islamic pedagogical faculty of the University of Zenica, Bosnia and Herzegovina izet.pehlic@unze.ba	Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorasgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: yousefi1393@khuif.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani  Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran. Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The article describes the Meaning in Life Questionnaire but does not mention its adaptation for the Iranian population. Was linguistic validation or cultural adaptation conducted? Providing evidence of adaptation would enhance validity.

Were therapy sessions monitored for adherence to the protocols? Including information on therapist training, supervision, or session fidelity checks would improve methodological rigor.

The article mentions normality was confirmed via Shapiro-Wilk tests, but specific test values (W-statistic, p-value) are not reported. Including these statistics would enhance transparency.

The discussion attributes improvements to Positive Psychology Therapy but does not explain potential mediators. Were changes in cognitive reappraisal or resilience examined? Speculating on potential mechanisms would add theoretical depth.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The study employs Cattell's Self-Awareness Questionnaire. However, it is unclear if confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) was performed to validate its structure in this study sample. Including CFA results would strengthen construct validity.

The Positive Thinking Therapy and DBT interventions lasted 15 sessions of 90 minutes each. How was this duration determined? Providing references to prior studies using similar session structures would justify the intervention length.

The ANOVA results indicate significant effects, but post-hoc comparisons between groups are not fully detailed. Were all pairwise comparisons (e.g., Positive Thinking Therapy vs. DBT) tested, and which were significant?

The article states that post-test improvements were maintained at follow-up. However, reporting the effect sizes for follow-up changes would strengthen conclusions about long-term efficacy.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.