

Article history: Received 09 January 2025 Revised 03 March 2025 Accepted 11 March 2025 Published online 19 March 2025

KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus

OPEN PEER-REVIEW



E-ISSN: 3041-9026

Developing a Curriculum Planning Model for Teaching Social and Emotional Skills

Hosein. Baghaee 1*0, Parisa. Valizad Ziyaie 20, Raziyeh. Jafarpour 20, Fatemeh. Valipour 20

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Curriculum Planning, Marand Branch, Islamic Azad University, Marand, Iran ² PhD student in Curriculum Planning, Department of Educational Sciences, Marand Branch, Islamic Azad University, Marand, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: hosseinbmd@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Şennur Tutarel Kışlak®	Reviewer 1: Mohsen Kachooei ©
Department of Psychology/Faculty	Assistant Professor of Health Psychology, Department of Psychology, Humanities
of Language, History and	Faculty, University of Science and Culture, Tehran, Iran. kachooei.m@usc.ac.ir
Geography, University of Ankara,	Reviewer 2: Nadereh Saadati [©]
Ankara, Turkey kislak@ankara.edu.tr	Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,
	California, United States of America, mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

You mention, "Studies indicate that a majority of teachers report feeling underprepared..."—please specify which studies or provide exact percentages or statistics to enhance the credibility of the claim.

The sentence "For instance, in collectivist cultures, SEL programs should emphasize group harmony and social responsibility..." requires a citation that directly addresses SEL implementation in collectivist societies to substantiate the example.

The presentation of open codes is very rich. However, consider grouping similar codes (e.g., emotional expression techniques, teacher strategies) within the table or providing subheadings to aid readability.

The discussion of "interactive activities such as role-playing, storytelling, and cooperative learning" is strong. Consider linking this to existing SEL pedagogical frameworks to strengthen its grounding in literature.

The axial coding table is valuable but would benefit from a clearer visual distinction between different thematic categories, possibly through color or formatting for easier navigation.

You state that "the analysis revealed that participants frequently emphasized... emotional intelligence, classroom-based strategies..."—it would help to include direct quotations from participants to enrich the thematic claims.



OPEN PEER-REVIEW

The phrase "highlighting key components necessary for an effective SEL curriculum" is vague. Please specify the top three most critical components based on your data to sharpen the conclusion.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The phrase "This research contributes to the growing body of literature..." is generic. You might enhance impact by briefly identifying how your model is distinct from other existing SEL curriculum models.

The statement "member checking and expert validation were employed" should be expanded. Describe how member checking was conducted—did participants review transcripts, themes, or final findings?

The demographics are described in detail, but it would be valuable to explain how these characteristics influenced the diversity or reliability of the data collected.

While this table is comprehensive, it is dense. Consider summarizing the most critical links between selective and axial codes in the text to help readers interpret the model more easily.

The sentence "These axial codes set the stage for the selective coding phase..." would be more informative if you briefly explained the rationale for transitioning from axial to selective coding.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

> KMAN-CPN KMAN-Counseling & Psychology Nexus

2