




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Self-Care Training and Self-Compassion Training on Hope in Kidney Transplant Patients




Maryam. Saeedi¹, Mohammadreza. Zarbakhsh Bahri^{2*}, Ali. Khaneh Keshi³

¹ Department of Clinical and Health Psychology, To.C., Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

² Department of Psychology, To.C., Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran

³ Department of Psychology, BE.C., Islamic Azad University, Behbahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: M.zarbakhsh@iau.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Asoke Kumar Saha  Professor Department of Psychology, Jagannath University, Dhaka, Bangladesh drasoke@psychology.jnu.ac.bd	Reviewer 1: Faranak Saboonchi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: faranaksaboonchi@pnu.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Maasuomeh Behboodi  Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: masomehbehbodi@riau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the paragraph beginning “Side effects of medications...”, the sentence “Hope is a crucial component of mental health...” would benefit from integration into a theoretical model of hope. The authors may consider referencing Snyder’s Hope Theory more explicitly to guide the study rationale.

Although the article reports Eta squared, it would be helpful to report partial Eta squared values where appropriate, especially for within-subjects effects. Also, include post-hoc power analysis to justify the sample size.

In Table 1, the format lacks clear column alignment and units. It is difficult to compare pretest, posttest, and follow-up means across groups at a glance. Reformat the table for easier interpretability.

The explanation of how self-compassion increases hope (e.g., via psychological flexibility or emotion regulation) is speculative. Provide references to empirical mechanisms linking self-compassion and hope, or explicitly label them as theoretical interpretations.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The paragraph starting with “Given the importance of kidney transplantation...” partially reiterates earlier content. Consider integrating this with the first introductory paragraph to reduce redundancy and improve flow.

The authors claim “the lack of studies in this area according to literature reviews” without citing a scoping or systematic review. Please provide a reference or specify the scope of the review conducted to support this claim.

The sentence “As shown in Table 3...” should be preceded by a sentence explicitly stating the comparison objective. Provide a stronger link between the analysis and its interpretation.

The results report significance but lack practical interpretation. For instance, stating that self-compassion increased hope from $M = 27.53$ to $M = 42.20$ is powerful. Use text to narratively emphasize these improvements.

The discussion (especially in the paragraph beginning “To explain these findings...”) cites prior studies inconsistently. Some sources (e.g., Barnett & Homany, 2022) are referenced repeatedly. Include more recent empirical studies on hope in chronic illness populations to diversify citations.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.