

# Investigating the Effectiveness of Intensive Short-Term Dynamic Psychotherapy (ISTDP) on Quality of Life and Mental Health in Depressed Women




Amin Allah. Bayat Mokhtari<sup>1</sup>, Farshad. Samadi<sup>2\*</sup>, Mandana. Moayedi<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Master of Clinical Psychology, Torbat-e Jam Branch, Islamic Azad University, Torbat-e Jam, Iran.

<sup>2</sup> Ph.D. in Health Psychology, Imam Reza (AS) Hospital, North Khorasan University of Medical Sciences, Bojnurd, Iran.

<sup>3</sup> Master of Psychology in Education of Exceptional Children, Qaenat Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qaen, Iran.

\* Corresponding author email address: farshadsamdi@gmail.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Izet Pehlić  Full professor for Educational sciences, Islamic pedagogical faculty of the University of Zenica, Bosnia and Herzegovina izet.pehlic@unze.ba	<b>Reviewer 1:</b> Fahime Bahonar  Department of counseling, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir <b>Reviewer 2:</b> Zahra Yousefi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Z.yousefi1393@khuif.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The citation “World Health, 2017” appears without consistent formatting. Ensure all citations follow APA style and match the reference list exactly.

The study uses convenience sampling followed by random assignment. It would improve rigor to discuss potential biases introduced by convenience sampling and whether any stratification was attempted.

There is no mention of how fidelity to the ISTDP protocol was ensured. Was the therapist supervised or trained by ISTDP-certified professionals? Was any session recording or rating performed?

The rationale for selecting 30 participants is missing. Please include a power analysis or justification for this sample size, especially given the inferential statistical tests used.

The manuscript states that the study was not blinded. Please address how lack of blinding may have affected outcomes, particularly given the subjective nature of the self-report tools.

The control group received no treatment. Consider addressing whether an attention control (e.g., placebo or waitlist) would have helped rule out nonspecific effects of therapist contact.

While reliability and validity are mentioned for WHOQOL-BREF and GHQ-28, psychometric values are outdated (2002, 2006). Please cite more recent validations if available or discuss why these remain applicable.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

While the literature on ISTDP is well-cited, the introduction lacks a strong critical discussion of why this study is needed in the Iranian context beyond brief mentions of access limitations. Expand on why previous findings are insufficient.

The term "quality of life" is introduced but not adequately linked to depression until later. Consider integrating its significance earlier when discussing depressive symptoms to strengthen coherence.

Internal consistency coefficients (Cronbach's alpha) for the current study sample are not reported. These are essential to confirm reliability in this context.

Although ANCOVA results are clearly presented, the table could benefit from inclusion of partial Eta squared in parentheses after F-values, which is more standard APA style.

The manuscript cites the Shapiro–Wilk test but reports p-values  $>0.05$ . While this implies normality, it may be helpful to note that ANCOVA is robust to minor deviations, especially with equal group sizes.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.