

Article history: Received 17 July 2025 Revised 12 November 2025 Accepted 18 November 2025 Published Online 01 January 2026

# **KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus**

**OPEN PEER-REVIEW** 



E-ISSN: 3041-9026

# Effectiveness and Comparison of Transdiagnostic Therapy and Cognitive—Behavioral Therapy on Positive Meta-Emotions in Pregnant Women

Masoumeh. Vatandoost 10, Reza. Khakpour 2\*0, Rahim. Davari 300

<sup>1</sup> Ph.D. Student in General Psychology, Department of Psychology, Ro.C., Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

- <sup>2</sup> Department of Counseling, Ro.C., Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran
- <sup>3</sup> Department of Psychology, Ro.C., Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author email address: reza.khakpour@iau.ac.ir

	Editor	Reviewers
Full professor for Educational sciences, Islamic pedagogical faculty of the University of Zenica, Bosnia and Herzegovina izet pehlic@unze.ba  Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University of Tehran, Iran.  Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir  Reviewer 2: Zahra Yousefi®	Full professor for Educational sciences, Islamic pedagogical faculty of the University of Zenica, Bosnia and Herzegovina	Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir  Reviewer 2: Zahra Yousefi®  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic

## 1. Round 1

# 1.1. Reviewer 1

# Reviewer:

In the paragraph beginning "Addressing this gap is especially relevant in psychological services for pregnant women in Iran...", the manuscript mentions the relevance of studying meta-emotions in Iran but does not explain what specific cultural norms about emotional expression make this context unique. Consider adding 2–3 sentences providing this needed cultural framing

Paragraphs 4 and 7 both emphasize that "positive meta-emotions contribute to resilience." This repetition disrupts flow. These paragraphs should be merged or rewritten to avoid stating the same conceptual idea twice.

The paragraph beginning "Despite this growing body of evidence..." does not clearly state why meta-emotions should be differentiated from general emotional regulation in pregnancy. A stronger justification for focusing on meta-emotions specifically is needed.



The sentence describing recruitment — "Among the 189 pregnant women... 45 participants who met the inclusion criteria were selected..." — is repeated almost verbatim in the following paragraph. Please remove duplication and provide a single precise description of the sampling process.

In the paragraph beginning "The improvement in positive meta-emotions is particularly important...", the sentence "Positive emotional states during pregnancy are associated with healthier fetal development..." implies a causal relationship. This should be softened to avoid overstating what was not directly measured in this study.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

# 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

The text states that participants were "randomly assigned to three equal groups." The manuscript should clarify whether simple randomization, block randomization, or another procedure was used, since this affects internal validity.

The Measures section reports Cronbach's alpha of .71, which is borderline acceptable. The manuscript does not discuss whether this may have reduced sensitivity to detect changes. A short justification or limitations note is needed.

The Interventions subsection describes eight weeks of active music therapy with detailed activities such as "claves," "tempo blocks," and "movement sequences." This description is unrelated to transdiagnostic therapy and CBT and appears to be included in error. This must be removed or completely rewritten to match the actual interventions.

Given the three-time-point design, the paper should include at least one line graph showing the group-by-time interaction. The absence of figures makes it difficult to visually inspect trends.

In Table 4, the group labels are repeatedly restated for each row (e.g., "Pretest – Transdiagnostic vs. Cognitive-Behavioral"). This creates unnecessary clutter. Consider restructuring the table with clearer grouping or multi-row labels.

In the first three paragraphs of the Discussion, the manuscript lists many studies consecutively without synthesizing their meaning. This results in heavy listing and weak integration. Summaries should be consolidated into thematic statements.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

KMAN-CPN
KMAN-Counseling & Psychology Nexus
E-ISSN: 3041-9026