

Article history: Received 17 March 2024 Revised 20 May 2024 Accepted 29 May 2024 Published online 26 June 2024

KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



Comparison of the Effectiveness of Time Perspective-Based Therapy with Cognitive Behavioral Therapy on Academic Motivation, Academic Passion, Academic Procrastination, and Academic Persistence in Secondary School Students Affected by Floods with PTSD Symptoms

Fariba. Rezaie¹, Mozhgan. Arefi^{2*}, Mohsen. Golparvar³

¹ PhD Student in Educational Psychology, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran ³ Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: mozhgan.arfi@yahoo.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Trevor Archer	Reviewer 1: Seyed Ali Darbani [®]
Professor Department of Psychology University of Gothenburg Sweden trevorcsarcher49@gmail.com	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. Email: Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir
	Reviewer 2: Mohammad Hassan Ghanifar [®]
	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad
	University, Birjand, Iran. Email: ghanifar@iaubir.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction outlines the impact of PTSD on academic performance well but could benefit from citing more recent studies beyond 2021 to enhance the relevance of the literature review.

The details for the CBT protocol are well-structured. However, the duration of each session and the interval between sessions are not specified. Including these details would enhance replicability.

The description of multivariate and univariate analyses is clear. However, the assumptions of homogeneity of regression slopes and variance could be discussed with more statistical rigor.

The pre-test means for some variables (e.g., academic engagement) show noticeable differences between groups, which might violate random assignment assumptions. Discussing potential baseline differences and their implications on the results is advised.

The limitation regarding the study's focus on flood-affected students is valid. However, discussing the generalizability of findings to male students or other trauma contexts would be valuable.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The concept of academic passion is introduced but not sufficiently differentiated from academic motivation. Adding a comparative explanation between these constructs could enhance clarity.

While the semi-experimental design is suitable, the rationale for selecting the specific age group of first-year secondary students is missing. Justifying this selection based on developmental or contextual factors is recommended.

The exclusion of students receiving medication is mentioned. However, the potential confounding effects of untreated PTSD symptoms in the selected sample should be discussed.

The exercises for shifting from past-negative to past-positive are described qualitatively. Quantitative metrics to evaluate the success of this transition would be beneficial.

The Mississippi PTSD Scale's reliability and validity data are from older studies. Adding a justification for its relevance in the current Iranian context or mentioning attempts to verify its reliability in this study would strengthen its use.

The significance of Wilks' Lambda is reported. Including partial eta-squared values for effect size interpretation would provide more depth to the findings.

The statement that "time perspective-based therapy is more effective than CBT in reducing procrastination" lacks an explanation for why this might be the case. Incorporating theoretical or empirical support would add depth.

The conclusion that academic perseverance improves due to optimism and goal-setting in time perspective therapy is plausible. However, linking this improvement to specific activities within the therapy sessions would enhance validity.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

