

Article history: Received 17 March 2024 Revised 20 May 2024 Accepted 29 May 2024 Published online 26 June 2024

# **KMAN Counseling & Psychology Nexus**

**OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT** 



Comparison of the Effectiveness of Time Perspective Therapy and Mindfulness Therapy on Academic Motivation, Academic Engagement, Academic Procrastination, and Academic Persistence in Flood-Affected High School Students with Symptoms of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder

Fariba. Rezaie 10 Mozhgan. Arefi 2\* 10 Mohsen. Golparvar 30

\* Corresponding author email address: mozhgan.arfi@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Trevor Archer® Professor Department of Psychology University of Gothenburg Sweden trevorcsarcher49@gmail.com	Reviewer 1: Seyed Ali Darbani  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.  Email: Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir  Reviewer 2: Mohammad Hassan Ghanifar  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad University, Birjand, Iran. Email: ghanifar@iaubir.ac.ir

#### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

### Reviewer:

In the introduction, the statement "PTSD symptoms encompass a range of psychological, physical, and behavioral conditions associated with individuals exposed to trauma" (p. 163) would benefit from including specific symptoms as defined by the DSM-5 for precision and clinical relevance.

The methods section states, "A total of 980 female students were selected through convenience sampling..." (p. 167). Justification for the use of convenience sampling in a quasi-experimental study is needed, along with potential biases it may introduce.

In the measures subsection, the PTSD scale description (p. 168) references a validation study from 2002. It is recommended to include more recent reliability and validity data, considering changes in PTSD diagnostic criteria over time.

PhD Student in Educational Psychology, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran
 Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran
 Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran



The findings section (p. 172) mentions that the control group showed no significant changes, but providing exact p-values and confidence intervals would increase statistical transparency.

In the discussion, the sentence "These results are consistent with the findings of Sliper et al. (2016), Andre et al. (2014), Stancu and Iorga (2015)..." (p. 173) lacks recent references. Incorporating studies from 2020-2024 would ensure current relevance.

The conclusion states, "Future research should include diverse populations and groups" (p. 175). It is recommended to suggest specific demographic variables that future studies should consider, such as socio-economic status or prior trauma exposure.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

The introduction mentions that "high motivation in students is recognized as a factor in reducing dropout rates and increasing students' academic success" (p. 163). It would be helpful to include recent empirical studies from 2020-2024 to support this claim

In the introduction, the paragraph beginning with "Time perspective is one of the novel approaches in psychology..." (p. 165) should include more recent citations beyond Zimbardo & Boyd (2008), as time perspective research has evolved significantly in the past decade.

The academic motivation scale is described as translated in 1992 (p. 168). Given the evolution in motivation theories, a justification for using this scale rather than more recent tools would enhance the methodological rigor.

In the intervention section, the mindfulness intervention details (p. 170) are comprehensive, but the theoretical underpinnings, such as which mindfulness model was followed (e.g., Kabat-Zinn's MBSR), should be clarified for theoretical alignment.

The time perspective therapy intervention (p. 171) states that it aimed to "shift participants' negative past perspectives to positive past perspectives." Clarifying which therapeutic techniques were used for this shift would improve transparency.

In the data analysis section (p. 171), specifying how assumptions for MANCOVA (e.g., normality, homogeneity of variance) were tested would strengthen the statistical methodology.

Table 1 (p. 172) provides descriptive statistics but lacks effect sizes. Including Cohen's d or  $\eta^2$  would provide a clearer understanding of the practical significance of the findings.

The discussion paragraph beginning with "Time perspective therapy helps improve an individual's well-being..." (p. 173) would benefit from more nuanced analysis of why this therapy was less effective for some variables, such as academic motivation.

In the discussion, the comparison between time perspective therapy and mindfulness therapy (p. 174) would be more robust if the authors discussed potential mechanisms underlying the differences in their effects on procrastination and persistence.

The limitations section (p. 175) mentions that the study "was not an experimental design," which contradicts the quasi-experimental design stated in the methods. This discrepancy needs to be clarified.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

KMAN-CPN
KMAN-Counseling & Psychology Nexus
E-ISSN: 3041-9026

KMAN-CPN
KMAN-Counseling & Psychology Nexus

E-ISSN: 3041-9026