

Article history: Received 29 September 2023 Revised 16 November 2023 Accepted 25 November 2023 Published online 01 December 2023

Psychology of Woman Journal

Open peer-review report



Effectiveness of Schema Therapy on Symptoms of Love Trauma, Depression, and Anxiety in Young Women with Experience of Emotional Failure

Fazeleh. Ebrahimi ¹, Naser. Amini ², Moloud. Keykhosrovani ²

¹ Ph.D. Student, Department of Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: amini_n2010@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Hussein OMAR Alkhozahe [®]	Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi
Professor, Department of Sociology,	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic
Al-Balqa' Applied University, Salt,	Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Z.yousefi1393@khuisf.ac.ir
Jordan	Reviewer 2: Hajar Torkan
huss1960@bau.edu.com	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan
	Branch (Khorasgan), Isfahan, Iran. h.torkan@khuisf.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Introduction - Paragraph 1:

"Various studies have shown that the failure and breakup of these relationships can also be one of the most painful emotional experiences an adolescent can undergo."

Comment: Provide citations for the studies mentioned. Include specific studies to support this claim.

Introduction - Paragraph 2:

"Emotional failure is a state of despair and terrible humiliation following a separation from a loved one who has rejected them."

Comment: This definition seems subjective. Consider rephrasing to a more clinical description or providing a source for this definition.

Introduction - Paragraph 3:



"According to the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders love trauma can be considered a post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) as it occurs after a traumatic event and causes physical mood and anxiety symptoms similar to those of PTSD."

Comment: Specify the edition of the DSM being referred to. Provide a direct citation to the DSM and any relevant sections. Methods - Study Design and Participants:

"The sample of this study consisted of 40 individuals from the research community in Amol who were selected using convenience sampling and randomly assigned to two groups: schema therapy (n=20) and control (n=20)."

Comment: Explain the process and criteria for convenience sampling. Discuss any potential biases this method may introduce.

Results - Descriptive Findings:

"In Table 1, the mean and standard deviation of the participants' scores for anxiety, depression, and love trauma symptoms in the research sample are presented."

Comment: Include effect sizes for the differences observed. Effect sizes provide additional context for the practical significance of your findings.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Abstract - Objective:

"The aim of the present study was to determine the effectiveness of schema therapy on symptoms of love trauma depression and anxiety in young women with experience of emotional failure."

Comment: Clarify what is meant by "emotional failure." Consider providing a brief definition or context to enhance reader understanding.

Methods - Measures:

"The Love Trauma Questionnaire developed by Ross (1999)..."

Comment: Provide more detail on the psychometric properties of this questionnaire, such as validity and reliability statistics.

Methods - Intervention:

"Session Two: This session involved reviewing the completed questionnaires and assessing schemas through mental imagery techniques."

Comment: Expand on the mental imagery techniques used. Provide references or theoretical underpinnings for these techniques.

Results - Repeated Measures ANOVA:

"Given that the calculated F value for the effect of the groups on anxiety (F=18.410)..."

Comment: Report the degrees of freedom for each F statistic. This information is critical for transparency and replication.

Discussion - Explanation of Findings:

"Schema therapy addresses the psychological themes characteristic of patients with personality disorders and considers these themes as early maladaptive schemas."

Comment: Discuss why schema therapy might be particularly effective for young women experiencing love trauma. Include more specific references to literature.

Discussion - Cognitive Consistency:

"The human tendency for cognitive consistency results in misinterpreting situations to reinforce schemas..."

Comment: Provide a theoretical framework or model to support this assertion. Cite relevant studies on cognitive consistency and schema reinforcement.





Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

