

Article history: Received 07 October 2023 Revised 25 November 2023 Accepted 11 December 2023 Published online 01 January 2024

## **Psychology of Woman Journal**

Open peer-review report



# Comparison of the Effectiveness of Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment and Short-Term Psychodynamic Therapy on the Spiritual Health of Women Affected by Marital Infidelity

Zahra. Karimi<sup>1</sup>, Mohammad. Ghamari<sup>2</sup>, Simin. Hosseinian<sup>3</sup>

Ph.D. student of Department of Counseling, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
Professor of Department of Counseling, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
Professor of Department of Counseling, Al-Zahra University, Tehran, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: mo.ghamari@iau.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Donatella Di Corrado	Reviewer 1: Sara Nejatifar 🗓
Associate Professor, Department of	Department of Psychology and Education of People with Special Needs, Faculty of
psychology, Kore University of	Educational Sciences and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.
Enna, Enna, Italy	Email: s.nejatifar@edu.ui.ac.ir
donatella.dicorrado@unikore.it	Reviewer 2: Zahra Yousefi
	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic
	Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Z.yousefi1393@khuisf.ac.ir

#### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

#### Reviewer:

The core issue in every intimate relationship involves the negative reaction to either real or imagined attraction..." - Consider including recent studies that explore modern perspectives on gender differences in responses to infidelity. This would add depth to the introductory framework.

"Pichon and colleagues (2020) define infidelity as an individual crossing the boundaries..." - The definition provided here could be more comprehensive. Please elaborate on the different types of infidelity (e.g., physical vs. emotional) and their psychological impacts as discussed in recent literature.

"In addition to unified transdiagnostic treatment another therapeutic approach in marital infidelity is short-term psychodynamic therapy..." - Provide a clearer distinction between the mechanisms of action for short-term psychodynamic therapy and unified transdiagnostic treatment. This will help in understanding their comparative effectiveness.

"Given that marital infidelity is one of the most bitter issues many couples face..." - Enhance this section by discussing the cultural context in Iran regarding marital infidelity and how it impacts women differently than in other cultures.



Psychology of Woman Journal 5:1 (2024)



"The methodology of the current research was quasi-experimental utilizing a pre-test post-test follow-up design with a control group..." - Clarify the rationale for choosing a quasi-experimental design over other possible designs, such as randomized controlled trials.

"Spiritual Health - This questionnaire was developed by Paloutzian and Ellison (1982)..." - Provide more detail on the psychometric properties of the Spiritual Well-Being Scale in the context of your sample. Discuss its validity and reliability further.

"Session 1: Introduction to the treatment methods and overview of the therapy..." - It would be helpful to include the theoretical basis for each session in the unified transdiagnostic treatment to better understand their selection and sequence.

"Mean and Standard Deviation of Spiritual Health in Experimental and Control Groups at Different Stages" - Ensure that the table includes confidence intervals for the means to better indicate the precision of the estimates.

"The Shapiro-Wilk statistic was not statistically significant at the 0.05 level..." - Include a brief explanation of why the normality of the data is important in the context of the statistical tests used.

"One-way Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) Results for Spiritual Health" - Provide a detailed interpretation of the effect sizes reported, especially in terms of their practical significance.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

"Another personality characteristic that can influence the relationships between couples and marital infidelity is their spiritual health..." - Clarify the connection between spiritual health and infidelity with more concrete examples or case studies from the cited research. This can help readers better understand this relationship.

"In Iran studies have been conducted on the effectiveness of various interventions for treating the consequences of marital infidelity..." - Include a brief summary of the key findings from these studies to contextualize the significance of the current research.

"Transdiagnostic treatment represents a common approach for a range of emotional disorders..." - Expand on how transdiagnostic treatments specifically address the issues faced by women affected by marital infidelity. Include any specific techniques or components that are particularly beneficial.

"Bonferroni Post Hoc Test Results for Spiritual Health at Post-test and Follow-up Stages" - Clarify why the Bonferroni correction was chosen for post hoc comparisons and discuss any implications this might have for the interpretation of the results.

"Data analysis indicated that the unified transdiagnostic treatment was effective in improving the spiritual health..." - Discuss potential mechanisms that could explain why unified transdiagnostic treatment was more effective than short-term psychodynamic therapy.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

### 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.