Comparison of the Effectiveness of Cognitive Emotion Regulation Training and Metacognitive Therapy on Guilt and Depression in Mothers Experiencing Miscarriage

Zeinab. Bandani[1], Maryam Sadat. Mirazim[2*], Zahra. Khoshbakht[3], Malihe. Nosratabadi[4], Hoda. Zamani rad[5], Farshad. Samadi[6*]

[1] Master's degree in Educational Psychology, Ahvaz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ahvaz, Iran
[2] Master's degree in General Psychology, Varamin Pishva Branch, Islamic Azad University, Varamin Pishva, Iran
[3] Master of Educational Sciences majoring in educational management, Shiraz University, Shiraz, Iran
[4] Master of Clinical Psychology, Shiraz University, Shiraz, Iran
[5] Master of Family Counseling, Khatam University, Tehran, Iran
[6] PhD in Health Psychology, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: farshadsamdi.com@gmail.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Parisa Nilforooshan	**Reviewer 1:** Farhad Namjoo
Professor of Psychology Associate Professor, Counseling Department, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Isfahan University, Isfahan	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: farhadnamjoo@kmanresce.ca
	Reviewer 2: Manijeh Daneshpour
p.nilforooshan@edu.ui.ac.ir	Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University, California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Based on a population study in Iran in 2000 about 26.7% of women had undergone intentional and illegal abortions." - Clarify the distinction between "intentional and illegal abortions" and "spontaneous miscarriage." These terms should be clearly defined for readers unfamiliar with the subject.

"A total of 60 women were selected through purposive sampling..." - The rationale behind choosing purposive sampling should be elaborated. Explain why this method was suitable for the study and how it may affect the generalizability of the results.

"all research variables in the experimental groups 1 2 and the control group are normal in both the pre-test and post-test phases as the Sig values for all of them are greater than 0.50." - This statement is unclear. It would be helpful to explain what is meant by "Sig values" in this context and why a threshold of 0.50 was chosen.

"Results of Two-Way Repeated Measures ANCOVA for Cognitive Emotion Regulation Training and Metacognitive Therapy on Guilt and Depression" - Clarify the meaning of "d.f (between)" and "d.f (within)" in the table. This will aid readers in understanding the statistical results presented.

"Comparison Results of Emotion Regulation Training and Metacognitive Training on Depression and Guilt" - The interpretation of the t-values and degrees of freedom should be included in the text accompanying the table. This would provide a clearer understanding of the results.

"The results indicated that both cognitive emotion regulation training and metacognitive therapy had a significant impact on reducing guilt and depression in these mothers." - It would be beneficial to compare these findings with previous studies. This comparison would highlight the study's contribution to the existing literature.

"Studies have shown that enhancing perceived social support reduces the mortality rate of patients and decreases the incidence of physical and psychological illnesses." - Provide references for these studies. Proper citation would strengthen the arguments made in this section.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2.   Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"In Iran the content and face validity of the questionnaire were confirmed by Naziri (1995)..." - Provide more details on the process used by Naziri to confirm the validity of the questionnaire. This information would enhance the reader's understanding of the reliability of the measures used.

"The first session outlines the rules and goals of the group sessions." - Include more specific details about the rules and goals set during this session. This information would help other researchers replicate the study.

"SPSS-24 software was used for data analysis." - Specify the statistical tests conducted using SPSS-24. Were there any assumptions checked for these tests? Including this detail would provide more transparency about the data analysis process.

"Descriptive Statistics Results (Mean and SD)" - The table lacks information on the significance levels of the differences observed. Including p-values or confidence intervals would provide a clearer picture of the statistical significance of the findings.

"The sample size was relatively small which may limit the generalizability of the results." - Suggest specific ways future studies could address this limitation, such as strategies for increasing sample size or different sampling methods.

"The study did not account for potential confounding variables..." - Identify which confounding variables could have influenced the results and suggest how future research could control for these variables.

"The findings of this study suggest that both cognitive emotion regulation training and metacognitive therapy are effective in reducing guilt and depression in mothers who have experienced miscarriage." - Discuss the practical implications of these findings for clinical practice. How should mental health practitioners integrate these therapies into their treatment plans?

"It is essential to provide training for mental health professionals on these interventions to ensure they can effectively deliver them." - Outline specific recommendations for the content and format of this training.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2.   Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.