

Article history: Received 23 October 2023 Revised 14 December 2023 Accepted 25 December 2023 Published online 01 January 2024

Psychology of Woman Journal

Open peer-review report



Generation Z Girls and the Quest for Authenticity: A Psychological Perspective

Ali. Derakhsh¹, Touran. Alizadeh Damie², Zahra. Seifsadat³, Shabnam. Barzgar³

Department of Psychology, Farhangian University, Tehran, Iran
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Farhangian University, Tehran, Iran
Master's degree in General Psychology, Yasouj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Yasouj, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Aliderakhsh755@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Niloofar Mikaeili	Reviewer 1: Kamdin Parsakia [©]
Professor of Psychology	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
Department of Mohaghegh Ardabili	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: kamdinparsakia@kmanresce.ca
University, Ardabil, Iran nmikaeili@uma.ac.ir	Reviewer 2: Farideh Dokanehi Fard
	Associate Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad
	University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: f.dokaneifard@riau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The Introduction should integrate more recent studies on Generation Z and authenticity, especially those published in the last three years. This would ensure the study is grounded in the latest research. ("Generation Z, born between the mid-1990s and early 2010s, has been characterized by their digital nativity and profound exposure to social media.")

The discussion on the impact of social media on authenticity could be expanded by integrating specific examples or quotes from the interviews, providing more depth to the analysis. ("Social media platforms, while offering opportunities for self-expression, also impose pressures to conform to curated images and societal expectations.")

It would be beneficial to compare the findings with studies conducted in different cultural contexts to highlight any unique aspects of the Iranian experience. ("Cultural and societal factors play a significant role in shaping the concept of authenticity...")

The paper should provide more specific recommendations for educators, counselors, and policymakers on how to foster authenticity among adolescents, based on the study's findings. ("The findings of this study have important implications for practitioners working with Generation Z girls.")



The Limitations section should discuss potential biases introduced by the qualitative nature of the study and the use of self-reported data. This would provide a more balanced view of the study's contributions. ("Despite the valuable insights provided by this study, several limitations must be acknowledged...")

Expand on the suggestions for future research, such as longitudinal studies to track changes in authenticity over time or quantitative studies to measure the prevalence of identified themes. ("Future research should consider a more diverse and larger sample to enhance the generalizability of the findings.")

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Provide a more detailed explanation of the thematic analysis process, including how themes were identified and refined. For example, mention the use of coding software or peer review of the themes. ("The data analysis followed a thematic analysis approach as outlined by Braun and Clarke (2006).")

Expand on the ethical considerations, especially how informed consent was obtained from the participants, given their minor status. This section should assure readers of the ethical rigor of the study. ("The study protocol adhered to the principles outlined in the Helsinki Declaration.")

The term "authenticity" is used extensively but is not explicitly defined early in the paper. Including a clear, concise definition in the Introduction would set a solid foundation for the study. ("Authenticity broadly defined as the alignment of one's actions with their true self...")

Ensure consistent use of terminology when referring to authenticity and related constructs. For example, avoid alternating between "true self" and "authentic self" without clarification. ("Participants described authenticity as being true to oneself, maintaining honesty and integrity...")

The discussion of the impact of authenticity on well-being would benefit from including quantitative findings from previous studies to support the qualitative data presented. ("Research indicates that being true to oneself can reduce anxiety, increase resilience, and foster a positive self-image...")

The thematic analysis results could be presented more effectively by using visual aids like charts or graphs to show the prevalence of each theme among the participants. ("Table 1: The Results of Thematic Analysis")

The paper references multiple theoretical frameworks without sufficient detail. Providing a brief explanation of each framework and how it applies to the study would enhance understanding. ("Theoretical frameworks suggest that authenticity is not merely a static trait but a dynamic process...")

Include a discussion on the methodological rigor of the study, such as the use of member checking or triangulation, to strengthen the credibility of the findings. ("The analysis was also peer-reviewed by two independent qualitative researchers to enhance the credibility and reliability of the findings.")

The subthemes identified in the thematic analysis are briefly mentioned. Providing a more detailed description of each subtheme with examples from the data would enrich the findings section. ("Themes and subthemes: Personal Definition, Social Influences, Emotional Connection...")

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.