




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Emotion Regulation-Based Therapy and Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment on Cognitive Insight in Women Engaged in Emotional Divorce with Early Marriage

Abdolhamid. Rastgar¹, Emad. Yousefi^{2*}, Leila. Khajepour³


¹ Department Of Counseling, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Science and Psychology, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: emad.yousefi30@gmail.com

Editor

Niloofer Mikaeili¹
Professor of Psychology
Department of Mohaghegh Ardabili
University, Ardabil, Iran
nmikaeili@uma.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Kamdin Parsakia¹
Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: kamdinparsakia@kmanresce.ca
Reviewer 2: Ali Khodaei¹
Department of Psychology, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alikhodaei@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "The reasons for these marriages can include adolescent love family pressure or religious and cultural reasons" is broad. Consider narrowing this down by citing specific studies or data that highlight the most prevalent reasons for early marriage in your study's context.

When describing Beck's Cognitive Insight Scale, the document mentions Cronbach's alpha values. It would be beneficial to include the values obtained from this study, as it would provide insight into the reliability of the scale in the specific context of your research.

The descriptions of the therapy sessions are detailed, but it would be helpful to provide a rationale for the selection of these specific interventions. Explain why these components were chosen over others that might be available in the literature.

The table presents descriptive statistics but does not clearly indicate the statistical significance of the differences between groups. Consider including p-values or confidence intervals to better illustrate the significance of the findings.

The discussion on the lack of significant differences between the two therapeutic approaches could be enriched by considering potential moderating variables that were not accounted for, such as the duration of the marriage or the presence of children.

The conclusion mentions the effectiveness of the interventions but does not discuss their potential long-term effects. Consider discussing whether the improvements in cognitive insight are likely to be maintained over time and how future research could explore this.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The phrase "Research on the causal and mediating conditions of emotional divorce" should be followed by a more detailed explanation of what these conditions are. For example, briefly explain how unmet emotional needs and male negligence specifically contribute to emotional divorce.

The concept of "negative cognitive insight" is introduced but not clearly defined in the context of emotional divorce. Consider providing a clearer definition or example to illustrate how it manifests in the population studied.

The comparison between cognitive-behavioral approaches and unified transdiagnostic treatment is somewhat general. Include specific aspects of these approaches that make one potentially more effective than the other in the context of early marriage and emotional divorce.

The sampling method (convenience sampling) may introduce bias. Please discuss the potential limitations of this sampling method in the discussion section and consider how it might affect the generalizability of the results.

The interpretation of effect sizes is missing. After presenting the F-values, it would be helpful to discuss whether the effect sizes (η^2) indicate a small, medium, or large effect according to Cohen's benchmarks.

The use of MANCOVA is appropriate, but the assumptions underlying MANCOVA (e.g., homogeneity of regression slopes) should be explicitly tested and reported in the results section.

The document states that "both therapeutic approaches have a comprehensive focus on emotional and cognitive insight." This could be strengthened by referencing specific literature that supports the comprehensive nature of these approaches.

The statement "the insight-oriented nature of both approaches is similar" could benefit from a deeper exploration of how this similarity might impact the effectiveness of each therapy. Consider discussing any potential advantages or disadvantages of this similarity.

The limitations section is well-structured, but it could be improved by discussing how future research could address these limitations, such as by using a randomized controlled trial design or by including male participants.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.