

# The Comparison of ACT and CBT on Health Anxiety and Emotional Self-Awareness of Adult Women with Generalized Anxiety Disorder

Zahra. Fattah Katamjani<sup>1\*</sup>, Sayeh. Mehmani<sup>2</sup>, Maryam. Rafiei<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Master Student of Clinical Psychology, Tehran West Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Master Student of Clinical Psychology, Islamshahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Islamshahr, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: zahra.fattah63@gmail.com

### Editor

Nilofar Mikaeili  
Professor of Psychology  
Department of Mohaghegh Ardabili  
University, Ardabil, Iran  
nmikaeili@uma.ac.ir

### Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Ali Akbar Soleymanian  
Associate Professor of Counseling Department, Bojnord University, Iran. Email: Soleymanian@ub.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Hajar Torkan  
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Isfahan, Iran. h.torkan@khuisf.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, you cite multiple studies, such as Apolinário-Hagen et al. (2020) and Mansouri et al. (2017), but there is no critical discussion of how these studies compare to your findings. Please add a paragraph discussing how your study contributes uniquely to the existing body of knowledge.

In the section "Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT)," more detailed descriptions of the specific activities during each session are needed. For instance, what mindfulness exercises were used in session 1?

The Emotional Self-Awareness Scale (ESAS) is introduced, but there is no mention of how the scale was validated in this specific population. Were cultural adaptations made for the Iranian participants?

In the data analysis section, you state that assumptions for repeated measures ANOVA were met but do not describe how outliers were treated. Please clarify if outliers were detected and how they were handled.

The results section presents the mean and standard deviation for each group. However, visual representation through graphs or charts could significantly enhance the clarity of these findings. Consider adding a figure to depict changes over time.

When reporting ANOVA results, please include effect sizes for all tests. Although partial eta-squared is provided in Table 2, it would be beneficial to discuss the practical significance of these effect sizes in the text.

In the sentence "The finding that ACT was as effective as CBT..." the discussion lacks depth in interpreting why both therapies yielded similar results. Was there an overlap in techniques, or could the mindfulness component of ACT explain the effectiveness? Please expand on this.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The comparison of CBT and ACT seems too superficial. In the sentence "Both therapies though rooted in different theoretical frameworks..." a deeper exploration of the theoretical underpinnings of ACT and CBT is needed to provide a richer context for your comparison.

You state that "Both therapies can be viable options," but the research question is not explicitly stated. I recommend adding a clear research question at the end of the introduction.

The limitations mention sample size and self-report bias but do not address potential therapist effects. Given that different therapists might have facilitated CBT and ACT sessions, how was therapist variability controlled?

The study was conducted in Tehran, and the sample consisted exclusively of women. Please include a discussion on how these factors might limit the generalizability of the findings to other populations, such as men or individuals from different cultures.

In the sentence, "Clinicians may consider patient preferences..." more concrete recommendations for practitioners are needed. How should clinicians decide between ACT and CBT for clients with generalized anxiety disorder based on this study?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.